TOWN OF HILLSBOROUGH SAN MATEO COUNTY

Planning Office (650) 375-7411 Fax (650) 375-7415



1600 Floribunda Avenue Hillsborough California 94010

Architecture and Design Review Board Approved Minutes

August 18, 2008 at 4:00 p.m.
Town Hall, 1600 Floribunda Avenue – Community Room

Applicants: Your extra plans will not be returned at the meeting; they will be available in the Planning Office for one week after the meeting.

CALL TO ORDER - 4:00 pm

Boardmembers Present – Jennifer Werbe, Chair; Carl Goldstone, George Jewett, Charlie Barnett, Mark Heine, Lin Ho (Alternate)

Boardmembers Absent – None

Staff Present - Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning; Serena Ponzo, Assistant Planner

Others - Mayor Mullooly

APPROVAL OF MINUTES — July 07, 2008

A motion (Jewett / Heine) to approve the July 07, 2008 meeting minutes passed 5-0.

WRITTEN/ORAL COMMUNICATIONS - None

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

Chair Werbe made an announcement that the applicants for 332 Darrell (Agenda Item #4) had requested continuation to the October 06, 2008 ADRB meeting and noted that this announcement would be considered the public notice for the project's review at the October 6, 2008 ADRB meeting.

A motion was made (Jewett / Goldstone) to recommend continuation of the proposal to the October 06, 2008 ADRB meeting passed 5-0.

Consent Items:

3250 Ralston Avenue – Phillips (Stewart Associates)

Enclosure of an existing second floor terrace of approximately 285 square feet (14.23%) to an existing two story residence. Recommendation: Approve the second story terrace enclosure subject to the Standard Conditions of Approval.

2. 2186 Parkside Drive – Kordestani (Winges Architects, Inc.)

Minor revisions to a previously approved ADRB teardown to include additional square footage on the second level of approximately 490 square feet (21.8% Floor Area Ratio). *Recommendation:* Approve the revision to the second story subject to the Standard Conditions of Approval.

A motion to recommend approval of consent items 1) 3250 Ralston Avenue and 2) 2186 Parkside Drive (Heine / Jewett) subject to the Standard Conditions of Approval and previous Staff approvals passed 5-0 based on consistency with the design guidelines and compatibility with the existing neighborhood context.

Regular Items:

Landscape Plans

3. 5 Drayton Road – Vernon (Outer Space Landscape Architecture)

Landscape plan associated with previously approved first and lower level addition (22.1% Floor Area Ratio) which includes tree removal, new plantings, retaining walls, hardscape and mailbox.

Jude Hellewell, landscape architect, made a brief presentation on the proposal and provided the Board with hardscape samples to be utilized in the walkway, retaining walls and free standing walls for the project. She also made herself available to answer questions of the ADRB.

No public comment was made and Chair Werbe moved to close the public hearing.

Boardmember Goldstone wanted to confirm that the same materials presented would match the residence and was pleased to see that the trees which were of concern at the June 2nd ADRB meeting, would be maintained and protected.

Boardmember Ho was also pleased to see the trees maintained at the front of the property.

Boardmember Barnett commented that although the plan and materials proposed are nice, it was difficult to read the plans as drawn. He recommended a more legible plan for future applications.

Boardmember Jewett agreed with the plan's legibility.

Boardmember Heine complemented the color of the travertine material proposed and asked the landscape architect if she had been successful with this material in the past.

Jude Hellewell, landscape architect, responded that the architects on the project have used the product successfully on past projects.

Chair Werbe expressed support for the proposal.

A motion (Barnett / Jewett) to recommend approval subject to the Standard Conditions of Approval and TCLA comments passed 5-0, based on the project's consistency with the design guidelines and compatibility with the existing neighborhood context.

Addition/Remodels

4. 332 Darrell Road – Avedon / Kelly (Flury Bryant Design Group)

Continued review of a second floor addition of approximately 556 square feet, the reconstruction and enlargement of a two car garage of approximately 665 square feet and addition of a

basement area of approximately 242 square feet (23.96% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing one story residence. Continued from the July 07, 2008 ADRB meeting.

The ADRB voted to recommend continuation to the October 06, 2008 ADRB meeting (please refer to beginning of meeting).

5. 440 Roehampton Drive – Ericson (Five Design)

First floor expansion of approximately 834 square feet which involves the reconstruction and expansion of an existing two car garage, second floor addition of approximately 566 square feet and a basement expansion of approximately 164 square feet (22.8% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story residence.

Claire Beasley, project architect, made a brief presentation on the proposal, highlighting the purpose and goals for the interior and exterior renovations.

No public comment was made and Chair Werbe moved to close the public hearing.

Boardmember Heine commented that the application package was complete and noted that the proposal includes quite a bit of addition in the setback area. He noted that the massing was appropriate and the garage renovations enhanced the existing residence. He recommended incorporating landscape screening for the side setback area but also noted that the neighbors were not present with any issues regarding the proposal.

Boardmember Jewett stated his support for the project and commented that the effect of the gable above the garage could have been achieved with a dormer.

Boardmember Barnett also commented on the gable above the garage and noted his preference for a hip roof but supported the project due to the existing screening and its minimal visibility from the street.

Boardmember Goldstone expressed his confusion with the addition encroaching into the setback area and the regulations which apply.

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, clarified the code regulation which does allow the continuation of an existing legal non-conforming setback so long as the degree of nonconformity is not increased. She confirmed that the project met the regulations pertaining to continuation of the legal non-conforming setbacks.

Boardmember Goldstone expressed concern with the proposed patching of the roof area and noted that a good amount of roof would be patched with the removal of the existing dormers at the front and rear elevations.

Claire Beasley, project architect, explained that the proposal is to match the existing; however, the Planning Department had notified her of this concern with patching at the time of submittal. She stated that the property owners were prepared to re-roof the residence if the ADRB felt it would be necessary.

Boardmember Ho concurred with the rest of the Board on the patch and match proposal.

Chair Werbe expressed support for the project with the condition that the entire residence is reroofed.

A motion (Goldstone / Heine) was made to recommend approval subject to the condition that the entire residence is re-roofed as a result of the dormer removal and subject to the Standard Conditions of Approval based on consistency with the Design Guidelines, existing neighborhood context and Zoning Regulations passed 5-0.

6. 1470 Crystal Drive – Javaherian (Behravesh & Associates Architecture)

Remodel and first floor addition of approximately 1,404 square feet around the perimeter of the existing one story residence and garage addition of approximately 216 square feet (19.2% Floor Area Ratio) to accommodate a three car garage.

Ben Behravesh, project architect, made a presentation on the proposal and made himself available to answer questions of the ADRB.

Javaherian Manoocherhr, property owner, noted the reasons for his proposed renovations and asked the ADRB for their support on the project.

No additional public comment was made and Chair Werbe moved to close the public hearing.

Boardmember Jewett stated the project was improved with the revisions made, requested confirmation on the gutters and whether or not they would be painted and noted that the columns at the trellis seemed to be underscaled. He expressed concern with the clay tiles proposed for the roof and stated that the tiles need to be a mix of tones; however, he was supportive of the project.

Boardmember Heine stated that due to the scope of work proposed, the project would essentially result in a new home. He stated that the application needed additional detail and consistency in the details, specifically in the cut sheets for the windows, which currently have two brands proposed, although Marvin windows are preferred. He stated that the stucco moldings are lacking architectural interest, but improved from the initial design and that additional detail should be submitted for the eaves, wrought ironwork and recommended revisiting the size of the fixtures proposed, as they seemed too small for the scale proposed.

Boardmember Barnett stated that the massing and scale were appropriate to the neighborhood context. He recommended studying the style of architecture further, specifically as it relates to the detail of the entry, overhangs and eave details. He noted that the proposed FAR (Floor Area Ratio) was under 20% and recommended selecting a higher quality roof tile, such as Redlands, with a more authentic finish.

Boardmember Goldstone agreed with Boardmember Barnett and noted the inconsistency in the proposed window types as well as in the proposed gutter notations (some copper and some painted). He also requested larger elevations on each elevation sheet and commented that a landscape plan should be submitted.

Boardmember Ho noted that the proposal was a great improvement and it fit well within the existing neighborhood context; however, his main concern was with the distance and elevation height inconsistency between the garage and main residence.

Chair Werbe echoed the concerns of the Board and stated that the project would benefit from an additional review with the Board. She also recommended viewing the Redlands roof tile selection for a tile with an authentic finish.

A motion (Barnett / Goldstone) to recommend continuation of the project to the September 15, 2008 ADRB meeting requiring revisions to the plans including additional details on the front door, garage, windows, entry, trellis, roof tile, landscape plan and to allow additional studying of the historical precedence for the architectural style proposed passed 5-0.

New Houses

7. 725 Jacaranda – Colina / Aish (Stewart Associates / Callan Landscape Architect)
Teardown / major remodel with first floor addition of approximately 1,949 square feet, second level addition of approximately 1,440 square feet, new basement of approximately 218 square feet (16.96% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new front entrance gates, new plantings and patio areas. *Preliminary review: June 02, 2008.*

Chris Ruffat, Stewart Associates and Michael Callan, Landscape Architect, made a brief presentation on the proposal and landscaping and made themselves available to answer questions of the ADRB.

No public comment was made and Chair Werbe moved to close the public hearing.

Boardmember Ho expressed his support for the improvements and proposal.

Boardmember Goldstone questioned Chris Ruffat, project architect, on the location of the chimney in the living room fireplace.

Chris Ruffat, project architect, confirmed that the fireplace proposed is gas and therefore no chimney exists on the plans.

Boardmember Barnett commented that the proposal is appropriate to the neighborhood and complemented the roof tile selection; however, he did have some concerns with the balustrade and oval windows proposed.

Boardmember Jewett expressed his support for the project and also complemented the reclaimed roof tiles selected; however, he noted his concerns with the oval windows and commented that there was a substantial amount of stone veneer in the proposal.

Chris Ruffat, project architect, confirmed that the veneer selected is a natural stone veneer.

Boardmember Heine agreed with the Board with regards to the oval windows and noted his concerns with the railings proposed. He noted that the stone veneer will appear natural and stated that he was generally in support of the proposal.

Chair Werbe noted her preference for removing the oval windows and expressed her concern with the use of concrete for the balustrade.

A motion (Jewett / Heine) to recommend approval of the project subject to the Standard Conditions of Approval, TCLA (Town Consulting Landscape Architect) comments with strong

encouragement to remove the oval windows from the project design, passed 5-0, based on consistency with the existing neighborhood context and design guidelines.

8. 68 Mountain Wood Lane – Miller (TRG Architects / Callan Landscape Architect)

New two story residence of approximately 7,966 square feet (19.1% Floor Area Ratio) on a vacant lot with associated landscape plan including retaining walls, tree removal, new plantings, patio areas and driveway. *Preliminary review: June 02, 2008*

Yossi Zinger of TRG Architects and Michael Callan, Landscape Architect, made a brief presentation outlining the changes made to the project and made themselves available to answer questions of the ADRB.

No public comment was made and Chair Werbe moved to close the public hearing.

Boardmember Barnett complemented the project and its compatibility to the neighborhood and mission statement of the subdivision. He commented on the entry columns and noted his concerns with the shed dormer over the garage.

Boardmember Goldstone expressed his support for the great improvements made to the plans since the preliminary review. He questioned the plan consistency with windows on sheet A21 and questioned the architect on internal configurations for the proposal. He also noted the six foot stucco columns half way up the walkway and questioned if the pine tree should be replaced.

Michael Callan, Landscape Architect, confirmed that to add the lighting, two foot tall stucco walls were added on either side, which can be lowered. He added that three trees would be removed to accommodate the new residence.

Boardmember Ho expressed his concerns with the columns and copper roof and their consistency with the architectural style proposed.

Boardmember Heine complemented the house design, the use of wood paneling and half timbering and recommended incorporating more of this detail into the plans. He expressed support for the use of a copper roof and felt the columns could be better integrated into the design. He also expressed concern with the six foot columns.

Boardmember Jewett stated that the columns appeared to be from a different project and recommended that the material be changed to a redwood subject to review by Planning Staff. He then complemented the project design and details.

Chair Werbe agreed with the Boardmembers and complemented the home design; however, she expressed her concerns with the copper roof proposed.

A motion (Jewett / Heine) to recommend approval of the project subject to the Standard Conditions of Approval, TCLA comments and the condition that the white entry features be redesigned subject to an administrative review, passed 5-0.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW (Not public hearing items; Board comments only)

- 9. 585 Pullman Road (2nd Preliminary Review) Teardown and new two-story residence
- 10. 3480 Ralston Avenue Façade revisions to previously approved new two-story residence
- 11. 610 El Cerrito Road Teardown and new multi-level residence

The Board reviewed the three items scheduled for preliminary review.

DISCUSSION ITEM

12. Project Updates

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Planning & Building, provided the Board with an overview of recent City Council actions associated with the projects at 930 Hillsborough Blvd. and 3000, 3030 & 3050 Ralston Avenue. She informed the Board that the City Council had voted to uphold the decision of the ADRB for 930 Hillsborough and denied the appeal and the City Council had approved the proposal for a new residence, guest house, tennis pavilion and lot merge at 3000, 3030, 3050 Ralston Avenue.

She added that Staff is currently working to update the ADRB and Admin applications, SAMCAR was notified of the Town's Design Guidelines and that a newsletter will be sent out to local design professionals quarterly with specific highlights and information as they relate to the Town and development applications. Furthermore, the City Council would consider adoption of ordinance amendments, one of which would amend the ADRB's role to be a deciding body as opposed to a recommending body.

Chair Werbe noted that it would be helpful to have a "Helpful Hints for Remodeling" article, which she volunteered to create the first draft.

13. Discussion of City Council direction for thresholds

Planning Staff and the ADRB continued discussions regarding establishing thresholds for specific requirements (landscaping, re-roof, etc) based on direction provided by City Council. The ADRB recommended that Staff review projects on a site specific basis and advise applicants that comprehensive upgrades may be required for projects creating a substantial change to the street façade. Further the ADRB recommended that a list of key indicators (such as large additions and window and façade changes visible from the public right-of-way) be utilized to assess whether more comprehensive upgrades would be required by the ADRB.

<u>ADJOURNMENT</u>

The meeting was adjourned at 5:54 pm.