

TOWN OF HILLSBOROUGH

San Mateo County

Planning Office
(650) 375-7411
Fax (650) 375-7415

1600 Floribunda Avenue
Hillsborough, CA 94010



Architecture and Design Review Board Approved Minutes

Monday, March 07, 2011 at 4:00 pm
Town Hall, 1600 Floribunda Avenue – Community Room

CALL TO ORDER – 4:00 PM

Boardmembers Present: Mark Heine, Chair; Eric Nyhus; Julie Tenenbaum; Christian Huebner; Jerry Wings; Nan Ryan, Alternate

Boardmembers Absent: None.

Staff Present: Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning; Serena Ponzo, Associate Planner; John Mullins, Building Official

Others: Councilmember Larry May

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion (Tenenbaum / Huebner) to approve the January 24, 2011 ADRB meeting minutes passed 4:0:1 (Wings abstaining).

WRITTEN/ORAL COMMUNICATIONS – None.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

Consent Items

Additions/Remodels

1. **108 Baywood - Holterman (Graham M. Simmons Architect)**
Request for a ground floor addition of approximately 670 square feet (10.1% Floor Area Ratio) to the rear of an existing multi-level residence and new front entry stair and terrace.
2. **671 Brewer Drive - Stark (Andrew Mann Architecture)**

Request for a first and second floor addition of approximately 128 square feet (21.2% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing multi-level residence and associated facade improvements including a new trellis structure.

A motion (Huebner / Nyhus) to approve consent calendar items #1-2 passed 5:0.

Regular Items:

Chair Heine introduced Jerry Wingses to the audience as the newest appointed ADRB member.

Additions/Remodels

3. **1875 Willow Drive - Callinan (Winges Architects, Inc.)**

Request for a first floor addition of approximately 300 square feet and second floor addition of approximately 184 square feet (16.17% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story residence.

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, provided an overview of the process for homes which result in a net floor area of 8,000 square feet or greater, which requires City Council review unless it is waived by a unanimous vote of the ADRB with consent from the Council Commissioner and Director of Building & Planning. She announced that Councilmember Larry May, who is the Council Commissioner for Building & Planning, legally represented the Callinan family in 2008. Since that time, he is no longer in contract with the Callinan family as their attorney and would be able to act on the project, specifically consent to waive City Council review without a conflict.

Boardmember Wingses announced that he is the architect for the project, recused himself from the project's review and left the room.

Councilmember Larry May added that he had contacted the City Attorney regarding the manner, who confirmed that there was no conflict of interest present.

Letty Callinan, property owner, made a presentation to the ADRB, explained the project objectives and efforts made to resolve neighbor concerns.

Chair Heine opened the public hearing. As no members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Nyhus stated the house and addition were beautiful.

Boardmember Tenenbaum understood the reasons for the addition, adding that it made sense for modern family living. She added that the addition and detail of the proposal appeared to be original to the house.

Boardmember Huebner complimented the proposal and the duplication of the architectural detail.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan stated the addition and home were beautiful.

Chair Heine agreed with the Boardmembers.

A motion (Nyhus / Tenenbaum) to approve the request for a first floor addition of approximately 300 square feet and second floor addition of approximately 184 square feet (16.17% Floor Area

Ratio) to an existing two story residence passed 4:0 (Winges recused from review).

4. **735 Brewer Drive - Lane (TRG Architects / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for a first floor addition of approximately 1,690 square feet and second floor addition of approximately 962 square feet (19.13% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story residence and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new terracing, new swimming pool and new driveway surfacing.

Randy Grange, project architect, made a presentation to the ADRB and explained that the proposal was reviewed with the Town's historical consultant and designed to be differentiated from the main residence. He added that a garage was not part of the original house design and the intent with the new addition was to leave the original house in tact. He presented a rendering of the home with the addition.

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, explained that although it may seem counter intuitive, the goal of differentiating the new from the original home was to maintain the integrity of the original building.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, made a brief presentation to the ADRB, explained that many of the Town's Consulting Landscape Architect (TCLA) comments were technical in nature to address the requirements of the Water Efficiency in Landscaping Ordinance. He added that the large oak tree in the rear yard would be tested for Sudden Oak Death Syndrome, as recommended by the arborist. He also presented his responses to the TCLA comments and asked the Board to consider administrative review of the required changes.

Chair Heine noted the driveway was marked as 15-feet wide on the plans; however, the TCLA notes the driveway width as twenty feet wide near the gates. He asked if the Cypress trees would be maintained as a part of the plan.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, confirmed that the goal was to retain the Cypress trees and as many trees as possible onsite.

Chair Heine opened the public hearing. As no members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Tenenbaum noted the addition was appropriate for the site and for the neighborhood, which consisted of larger homes. She added that the proposal would bring the house to meet modern standards and that the design was well executed.

Boardmember Huebner stated the proposal was seamless and appreciated the design of the three car garage since only two garage spaces were visible from the front of the property. He noted the proposal had great integration but asked if the eaves could be designed the same as the main residence.

Randy Grange, project architect, explained that they were differentiated from the existing to meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and in working with the Town's Historical Consultant.

Boardmember Nyhus commented that the chimney at the back of the addition could be enhanced with more detail and noted his preference for the rafter details to match the existing, but understood the reasons for the differentiation.

Boardmember Wingses stated the addition was beautiful and included good siting of the garage and family room; however, he questioned whether the bonus room above the garage could be dropped in height to reduce mass. He expressed support for the proposal.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan expressed appreciation for retention of the existing windows, specifically the retention of one of a pair on the right side elevation. She complimented the project design.

Chair Heine stated the proposal would be an improvement and balance the house. He added that the residence appeared to be well screened and he was supportive of the project.

A motion (Nyhus / Huebner) to approve the request for a first floor addition of approximately 1,690 square feet and second floor addition of approximately 962 square feet (19.13% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story residence and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new terracing, new swimming pool and new driveway surfacing with the condition that the TCLA comments, specifically #8-13, be subject to administrative review passed 5:0.

New Houses

5. **1475 Crystal Drive - Der Abrahamian (Michael R. Carilli Design Group / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Continued review of the request for demolition of an existing one story residence and construction of a new two story French Eclectic style residence of approximately 5,453 square feet (24.9% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new plantings, new swimming pool, outdoor fireplace and kitchen, tree removal and new driveway cut. (*Continued at the January 24, 2011 ADRB Meeting*)

Michael Carilli, project architect, made a presentation to the ADRB and outlined the changes made to the design as well as the palette of materials proposed.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, made a brief presentation to the ADRB and informed them that the plan changes focused on the right side elevation to address privacy concerns.

Chair Heine opened the public hearing. As no members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Huebner noted that the winds had impacted the story poles, the changes made were significant and the rendering spoke volumes for the design.

Boardmember Tenenbaum stated that all previous concerns had been addressed with the revisions. She complimented the backyard transition and expressed support for the project.

Boardmember Nyhus stated he was not at the last meeting, although he had the opportunity to review the plans and complimented the house. He expressed his concerns with the several inconsistent planes at the front elevation and that the second story appeared to be attached versus integrated. He added that the windows lacked vertical alignment and the chimney at the right elevation appeared to be too simple.

Boardmember Winges stated he had the opportunity to review all materials from the previous meeting relating to the project and noted the changes as an improvement. He added that the rendering was helpful in communicating the design and although it was a big change for the neighborhood, the details were nicely done.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan stated the changes made for a more consistent design and the project would be a great improvement to the neighborhood.

Chair Heine agreed with Boardmember Nyhus on refining the fireplace. He complimented the changes to the entry and windows. He cautioned the applicants on over-screening and expressed his support for the project.

A motion (Huebner / Tenenbaum) to approve the request for demolition of an existing one story residence and construction of a new two story French Eclectic style residence of approximately 5,453 square feet (24.9% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new plantings, new swimming pool, outdoor fireplace and kitchen, tree removal and new driveway cut with the condition that landscape revisions be subject to the administrative review procedures passed 5:0.

6. **15 Stonehedge Road - Wang / Chen (Stewart Associates / Michael Callan Landscape Architect)**

Request for demolition of an existing one story residence and construction of a new two story French style residence of approximately 5,229 square feet (19.9% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new plantings, new driveway surfacing and new walkways. *(Preliminary review received at the January 24, 2011 ADRB Meeting)*

John Stewart, project architect, made a presentation to the ADRB, noting the changes made to the front elevation and the request to retain the bay window at the front in the design. He provided a rendering to the ADRB which illustrated the incorporation of the bay window back into the design.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, made a presentation to the ADRB and explained that he had met with the rear yard neighbors and could refine the landscape plan to address their concerns with privacy and screening. He stated the preference to retain the sycamore trees in the plan.

Chair Heine opened the public hearing.

Lorraine Carmassi, 310 Crystal Springs Road, expressed her concerns with privacy as it relates to the new two story structure. She requested that mature screening trees be provided in the landscape plan.

Chair Heine closed the public hearing.

Boardmember Nyhus stated the rendering was helpful in communicating the design and the requested changes. He added that the roof pitch was of concern; however, the materials proposed were of high quality and architecture was done nicely.

Boardmember Tenenbaum complimented the symmetry, noting the home fits well into the

neighborhood and expressed her support for the proposal.

Boardmember Huebner stated that the rendering spoke volumes and was very helpful.

Boardmember Winges stated that he had read the minutes from the last meeting and visited the site twice. He added that the rendering was helpful; however, he felt the house should be set back further back from the street, which would allow for a wider driveway and more meandering design. He inquired as to whether or not the shutters were glue on shutters, noting the preference for real shutters. He added that the lower windows could be improved from the current bay window proposed with full length transom windows and mentioned that a pedestrian gate should be in front of the house.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan stated that the revisions made for a more simple, cohesive design and preferred to see transom windows above the existing front windows. She expressed support for the design.

Chair Heine expressed concern with the garage doors and noted his preference for a transom as opposed to the bay window. He added that the garage should not be moved forward and liked Boardmember Winges' idea to meander the driveway.

John Stewart, project architect, stated that the wall in front of the residence was historical and they had no intention of altering it from its current location or condition, thus, the reason for not including a pedestrian gate in front of the entrance.

A motion (Nyhus/Tenenbaum) to approve the request for demolition of an existing one story residence and construction of a new two story French style residence of approximately 5,229 square feet (19.9% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new plantings, new driveway surfacing and new walkways with the conditions that the front elevation be revised to incorporate full length transom windows at the front elevation; landscape changes to address TCLA comments and privacy issues with adjacent neighbors and house location/orientation be revised (reviewed by a subcommittee of the ADRB) and subject to the administrative review procedures passed 5:0.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

(Not public hearing items; Board comments only.)

New Houses

7. 160 Bella Vista - Zhao (Chu Design / Michael Callan Landscape Architect)

Request for demolition of an existing one story residence and construction of a new two story French style residence of approximately 6,667 square feet (24.94% Floor Area Ratio) and associated conceptual landscape plan including tree removal, new swimming pool, new plantings, new walkways and new driveway surfacing. *(Preliminary Review received at the January 24, 2011 ADRB Meeting for a Mediterranean style residence)*

Boardmember Winges stated the site was amazing and house was nicely designed. He noted that the garage doors appeared to be craftsman style, not French, inquired as to why the columns on the porch were designed as square and recommended that the applicant insure the lights are frosted and low wattage to avoid light spillover. He stated the site plan and proposed

setbacks were good.

Boardmember Nyhus agreed with Boardmember Wingses and noted the proposal would be a great addition to the neighborhood. He mentioned the large amount of tree removal proposed and noted that a telltale sign of French architecture is the roof pitch proposed, referring to 1875 Willow Road. He recommended that the applicant explore better integrating the rooms into the roof and added that the proposed foyer, although grand on the interior, seemed curious at the front elevation. He recommended lining up the vents at the front elevation for enhanced vertical alignment.

Boardmember Tenenbaum complimented the detail of the proposal and stated it would be a beautiful home and improve the existing conditions. She added that the change to the driveway location was a positive improvement.

Boardmember Huebner noted the plans were well detailed for preliminary review; however, the direct vent fireplace looked curious at the right side elevation. He stated the neighborhood was one in transition and the proposal was appropriate for the context.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan expressed her support for the change in architectural style from Mediterranean to French and appreciated the direction of the proposal.

Chair Heine agreed with Boardmember Huebner regarding the direct vent fireplace element at the right elevation, but supported the direction of the design and complimented the ironwork, balustrades and other architectural details.

8. **35 Willard Drive - Wong (John Chan Architecture / WM Landscape Architecture)**

Request for preliminary review of demolition of an existing ranch style residence and construction of a new single level Modern Ranch style residence of approximately 5,157 square feet (22.2% Floor Area Ratio) with an associated basement area and conceptual landscape plan including new plantings, new driveway surface, new patios and lawn area. *(Received third preliminary review at the December 06, 2010 ADRB Meeting)*

Boardmember Huebner stated he understood the reasons for the new basement area and stated the concept was interesting, an aesthetic improvement and more consistent at the front elevation. He recommended the applicant address neighbor concerns and explore a reduction in windows on the right side.

Boardmember Wingses commented on the proposal and recommended care be taken with the retaining wall heights as well as roof pitches, as some appeared to be noted incorrectly. He recommended that the roof overhangs be checked for consistency with the roof pitches and that the metal roof be selected carefully, recommending a standing seam roof as opposed to the prefabricated edge and snap top roofs. He added that the incorporation of a steel trellis may enhance the contemporary feel of the proposal and break up wall mass at the right and rear elevations.

Boardmember Nyhus questioned the reasoning behind the variation in roof pitches and why a consistent roof pitch was not included in the design. He inquired on the height of the proposed retaining walls along the property line. He noted that the design was headed in the right direction.

Boardmember Tenenbaum stated the revisions were an improvement and recommended the concerns of the neighbor to the right be addressed. She requested that additional detail be included in the plans for the formal review.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan commented that the wall of windows would give the design a unique feeling.

Chair Heine commented that perhaps the center elevation could be revised to include a minor height increase. He noted that the eaves could be widened and commented on the right side elevation, noting the numerous windows and large amount of use proposed on that side. He recommended working with the neighbor to address concerns and noted that the design was headed in the right direction.

Boardmember Winges recommended the incorporation of longer eave overhangs and consistency throughout the design.

Additions/Remodels

9. **2905 Churchill Drive - Tung (Chu Design / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for preliminary review for a first and second floor addition of approximately 2,184 square feet (22.78% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two level residence, change in architectural style to Mediterranean and associated conceptual landscape plan including new plantings, new driveway surfacing, front fencing and driveway gates.

Boardmember Tenenbaum stated that the proposal was a definite improvement to the current conditions and the proposal included high quality materials. She questioned the use of double French doors at the front elevation and commented that the left elevation appeared busy with the incorporation of the copper shed roof and several other elements. She noted that the door system for the second unit was the same as the main front door and recommended making the main entrance to the home unique. She added that the size was appropriate for the site.

Boardmember Huebner agreed that the proposal would be a nice enhancement to the property. He commented on the windows and the fireplace in the living room. He complimented the use of the trellis in the design as well as the rendering presented.

Boardmember Nyhus noted the proposal as an incredible improvement to the site and recommended more detail be incorporated in the chimneys, as the chimney tops were very simple. He added that the design was headed in the right direction.

Boardmember Winges complimented the design and change. He commented that the front elevation appeared busy, specifically at the entry and encouraged the applicant to simplify.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan agreed with the ADRB comments, noted that the improvements were great and commented on the existing kitchen, specifically on its size compared for the size of the home.

Chair Heine stated the proposal was a great improvement, specifically commenting on the second unit entry. He added that the rendering created an appearance of a higher elevation from the street and in reality it appeared to be lower. He questioned if there would be a wall or gate off of the second unit entry and complimented the direction of the design.

DISCUSSION ITEM(S)

Presentation on the History of Hillsborough - Sally Meakin, Hillsborough resident, presented an overview of the history of Hillsborough to the ADRB and members of the audience.

ADJOURNMENT – 6:20 PM

Minutes prepared by:

Serena Ponzo, Associate Planner

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Sponzo', is located below the name Serena Ponzo.