

TOWN OF HILLSBOROUGH

San Mateo County

Planning Office
(650) 375-7411
Fax (650) 375-7415

1600 Floribunda Avenue
Hillsborough, CA 94010



Architecture and Design Review Board Approved Minutes

Monday, August 01, 2011 at 4:00 pm
Town Hall, 1600 Floribunda Avenue – Community Room

CALL TO ORDER – 4:00 PM

Boardmembers Present: Mark Heine, Chair; Jerry Wings; Julie Tenenbaum; Nan Ryan, Alternate

Boardmembers Absent: Eric Nyhus; Christian Huebner

Staff Present: Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning; Serena Ponzio, Associate Planner; Ray Yniguez, Acting Chief Building Official

Others Present: Councilmember Larry May

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion (Wings / Ryan) to approve the July 05, 2011 ADRB meeting minutes passed 2-0-2 (Heine & Tenenbaum abstained).

WRITTEN/ORAL COMMUNICATIONS – None.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

Consent Items

Additions/Remodels

1. **893 Crystal Springs Road - Tamer (Taylor Lombardo Architects)**
Request for a first and second floor addition of approximately 417 square feet (8.48% Floor Area Ratio) associated with the enclosure of two second level balconies, new entry facade and associated facade improvements including new slate roofing and wood windows to an existing two story residence.

2. **108 Baywood - Holterman (Graham Simmons)**
Request for the construction of a new detached three car garage of approximately 992 square feet (15.11% Floor Area Ratio) on a property with an existing multi-level residence.
3. **855 Tournament Drive - Yang (Elaine Lee Design)**
Request for a second floor addition of approximately 309 square feet (12.3% Floor Area Ratio) to the rear of an existing two story residence.
4. **130 Bridge Road - Herrin (Essalat Architects)**
Request for a first and second floor addition to the rear of the main residence totaling 1,142 square feet (680 square feet on the first floor and 462 square feet on the second floor) and replacement of an existing 502 square foot accessory structure with a new 1,313 square foot loggia/exercise room adjacent to the pool, for a total floor area of approximately 16% and associated facade improvements.

A motion (Ryan / Wings) to approve consent calendar items #1-4 passed 4-0.

Regular Items:

Landscape Plans

5. **1545 Bellevue - Wolfe (Michael Callan Landscape)**
Request for a new outdoor swimming pool measuring approximately 15' by 32' and ranging from 3' to 8' in depth with built-in spa and outdoor barbeque area adjacent to a portion of Ralston Creek, and minor architectural design revisions to the existing residence. A Mitigated Negative Declaration has been prepared for this project due to the potential impacts on the riparian corridor.

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, made a brief presentation on the proposal, provided an outline of the environmental review process conducted, reviewed the public comment received from Mr. & Mrs. Gurkoff, 1565 Bellevue Avenue, and provided an overview of the environmental consultant's responses to the public comment received which concluded that this creek is noted on the historical creek maps as intermittent or ephemeral; there was no evidence of high water ever reaching the support piers of the project site existing footpath Bridge; mitigation measures have been proposed to minimize potential effects of the bubble pits; utility line crossings and the equipment area are not expected to substantially affect flood flows or conveyance; a tree protection plan is required as part of the standard conditions of approval which the project will be subject to; that no structures would be implemented that block or impede the stream flood flows in excess of existing conditions as a part of the proposal; there is no indication that the project site is within a 100-year floodplain as it is not mapped as such on FEMA maps and there is no evidence of overtopping of banks along the project site channel which was identified. She stated that the environmental document concluded that there would not be significant impacts to riparian vegetation and creek bank stability resulting in erosion on the condition that mitigation measures were followed. She provided the environmental consultant's response to Boardmember Ryan's question regarding the use of salt water versus chlorine for the pool and potential impacts to the creek. The environmental consultants concluded that the use of salt water was more impactful than chlorine long term.

The ADRB took a few moments to review the new documentation presented to them at the meeting.

Bill Wolff, owner of 1545 Bellevue Avenue, made a presentation to the ADRB, explained the reasons the pool was needed and addressed comments received pertaining to noise.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, made a presentation to the ADRB, addressed the proposed mitigation measures and requested a staff level review of the new pool equipment enclosure.

Chair Heine opened the public hearing. As no members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Winges stated he was comfortable with the proposal and supportive due to the conclusion of the environmental assessment that there were no environmental impacts associated with the proposal with the incorporation of the mitigation measures. He initially questioned the proposed location of the pool equipment on the opposite side of the creek but after receiving the information regarding the pool equipment enclosure, he was supportive. He questioned if an alternate location had been explored for the pool equipment and acknowledged the distance between the neighbors at 1565 Bellevue in addition to the adequate screening that exists between properties. He added that the noise generated from the air conditioning condenser would be more detrimental than the pool equipment.

Boardmember Tenenbaum stated she was very comfortable with the conclusion of the environmental documents and assessment completed; however, she remained curious about the noise and proposed location of the pool equipment.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, distributed to the ADRB members a revised pool equipment enclosure plan and explained the concept.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan agreed with the other ADRB members in terms of the environmental assessment completed and acknowledged the brief amount of time which was used to process the application. She acknowledged the distance between the properties at 1545 and 1565 Bellevue, noting that the distance and screening would reduce noise impacts.

Chair Heine stated he was comfortable with the environmental review and determination and acknowledged the amount of work which had occurred in a short amount of time. He added that he was surprised the pool equipment enclosure proposal was not submitted earlier in the process to address the concerns. He expressed his preference to see a more substantial pool equipment enclosure, with block for example, and was supportive of the enclosure being reviewed by Staff.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, indicated they were receptive to the use of block for the enclosure material.

Chair Heine recommended the applicants complete the project as soon as possible for the neighbors and to avoid the grading moratorium.

Boardmember Winges recommended the enclosure be designed for architectural integration with the main residence, which may include a steeply pitched roof and slate roofing.

Chair Heine stated that an additional measure should be included in the resolution with the preference for the design of the enclosure (block wall and slate roof).

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, stated that mitigation measure #13 could be revised to include verbiage that the final location and design of the pool equipment enclosure be reviewed by Staff with the preferred design elements of the ADRB.

A motion (Winges / Tenenbaum) to approve the request for a new outdoor swimming pool measuring approximately 15' by 32' and ranging from 3' to 8' in depth with built-in spa and outdoor barbeque area adjacent to a portion of Ralston Creek, and minor architectural design revisions to the existing residence with the condition that mitigation measure #13 be revised to include the requirement for a staff level review of the pool enclosure and that the enclosure be consistent in design with the main residence passed 4-0.

Additions/Remodels

6. **234 West Santa Inez Avenue - Bligh (TRG Architects / Michael Callan Landscape)**
Request for a first and second floor addition of approximately 3,441 square feet (19.6% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story residence and associated landscape plan including new plantings, new driveway paving, new terracing, outdoor fireplace, pergola and new driveway gates and columns.

Randy Grange, project architect, made a presentation to the ADRB and made himself available to answer any questions.

Chair Heine opened the public hearing. As no members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Tenenbaum complimented the design and expressed her support for the proposal.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan commented that the proposal appeared to be a Monterey Colonial home that has been enhanced and expressed her support for the proposal.

Boardmember Winges complimented the property, project design, massing and arbor detail in front of the garage. He stated that the home would be one of the best in Hillsborough a good example of an addition. He did express his concerns with the proposed composition shingle roofing, noting it was not as high of quality as the house. He added that the detail of the existing columns at the front door was not clear and the proposed shutters seemed inconsistent with the architectural style, noting that the shutters made the home look colonial. He concluded that the brick columns at the entry gate with the pre-cast tops could be enhanced and upgraded.

Chair Heine expressed his support for the proposal, specifically the side facing garage, incorporation of shutters and gate design. He commented that he initially had concerns with the round and square columns; however, the rendering was helpful in clarifying the details. He noted his concerns with the composition shingle roof, but due to the lack of visibility of the house and roof, he was supportive.

A motion (Tenenbaum / Ryan) to approve the request for a first and second floor addition of approximately 3,441 square feet (19.6% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story residence and associated landscape plan including new plantings, new driveway paving, new terracing, outdoor fireplace, pergola and new driveway gates and columns passed 4-0.

New Houses

7. **15 Knightwood - Scheppler (TRG Architects / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for demolition of existing single story residence and construction of a new single story Ranch style residence of approximately 5,297 square feet (24.5% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new fencing, gates and columns, new plantings and stone patios. *(Received preliminary review at the April 04, 2011 ADRB Meeting)*

Randy Grange, project architect, made a presentation on the proposal, explained changes made since the preliminary review which included removal of the basement and outlined the changes which would be incorporated into the plans to address neighbor concerns, including the use of spray insulation, acoustical boards and inoperable windows on the elevation facing the neighbor on Forest View Avenue. He added that the floor area ratio (FAR) was high due to the amount of high ceiling areas in the home.

Chair Heine opened the public hearing. As no members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan complimented the design, noting it blended indoor and outdoor living and a home that could be well lived in. She acknowledged the design of the window shades, wood and stucco finishes.

Boardmember Wingses noted the proposal as refreshing contemporary and although initially it appeared the design would be monochromatic, the rendering was helpful in clarifying the details and finishes. He questioned if the wood trellis would be acceptable due to the property's location in the Wildland Urban Interface. He added that the fencing, gates and entry should be revised.

Boardmember Tenenbaum complimented the project and questioned why a wood shingle roof was not incorporated into the design.

Chair Heine agreed with Boardmember Tenenbaum regarding the wood shingle roof as a preferred material and noted that the gate design appeared to be too heavy and recommended it be revisited.

A motion (Wingeses / Tenenbaum) to approve the request for demolition of existing single story residence and construction of a new single story Ranch style residence of approximately 5,297 square feet (24.5% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new fencing, gates and columns, new plantings and stone patios with the condition that the front yard entry and driveway gate be revised subject to the administrative review procedures passed 4-0.

8. **40 Bates Road - Miller (TRG Architects / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for the construction of a new two story English Country style residence of approximately 5,100 square feet (24.78% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new driveway, new plantings, retaining walls, patios, walkways and new solid wood fencing at the side property lines on a vacant lot. *(Received preliminary review at the June 06, 2011 ADRB Meeting)*

Boardmember Wingses recused himself from review of the project due to close proximity of his residence to the project site and left the room.

Randy Grange, project architect, made a presentation to the ADRB, explaining the measures taken to address neighbor concerns and changes made since the preliminary review.

Chair Heine opened the public hearing.

Jamie Mendell, 55 Bates Road, stated the eucalyptus trees were directly in front of the installed story poles, which made it difficult to view the entire upper story. She expressed her concerns with the current landscape plan and noted that additional front yard planting should be included to soften and screen the new home.

Tom Layman, 31 Bates Road, requested clarification on the construction hours permitted in Town, noted that the story poles were installed at 8am on a Saturday morning, expressed concern with traffic and parking impacts associated with the construction vehicles and expressed his concern with the overall height of the home, noting that majority of the homes in the neighborhood were ranch styles.

Ray Yniguez, Acting Chief Building Official, explained the Town's regulations on construction hours, which are Monday through Friday, 8am – 5pm, Saturday from 10am-5pm, with no construction permitted on Sundays or holidays. He added that as a part of the permit process, a construction management plan would be required and a preconstruction meeting would be held with the contractor to review the Town's regulations and any specific conditions of approval related to the project.

Mickey Bock, 30 Bates Road, expressed her concerns relating to privacy, noting the proposed height was too high, view obstruction from other properties and referred to the empire state building in comparison.

Randy Grange, project architect, referred to the right side elevation, confirming that windows were limited on this elevation and majority of the windows were located at the rear elevation.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, explained the landscape at the right side included Grecian laurels to address privacy and screening issues.

Jamie Mendell, 55 Bates Road, stated to the applicants that oak root fungus was present in the ground at the left side of the property.

Randy Grange, project architect, explained that the house was designed to be depressed on the site to reduce view impacts.

Chair Heine closed the public hearing.

Boardmember Tenenbaum stated that view protection was not within the purview of the ADRB. She expressed her appreciation for the one and a half story element but expressed concern with the various hardscape materials proposed; however, she added that the house was not perfectly compatible with the existing styles of homes and the elevation was worth noting. She commented that the front porch appeared to be too large.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan expressed support for the overall appearance and design, although she expressed concern with the front door. She added that the proposal was different from the existing homes in the neighborhood; however, it was accurate in representing the

English style proposed and was an improvement to a difficult vacant lot.

Chair Heine clarified that the ADRB could not protect views and he remained supportive of the proposal. He added that there were homes in the neighborhood that were similar; however, they were not immediately adjacent to the site. He noted his support of a staff level review for the additional screening trees.

Serena Ponzo, Associate Planner, provided clarification on three issues as follows:

- 1) Acknowledged receipt of concerns from 60 Bates Road which included noise impacts, construction hours and the existing SFPUC utilities which run across the property. She indicated that the proposal would be subject to the Town's noise regulations, construction hours and the project would be subject to the conditions listed in the preliminary SFPUC approval;
- 2) The Town's residential design guidelines encourage diversity in architectural styles throughout neighborhoods; and
- 3) Informed the ADRB that the TCLA comments recommended additional screening trees (evergreen) be incorporated into the landscape plan.

A motion (Tenenbaum / Ryan) to approve the request for the construction of a new two story English Country style residence of approximately 5,100 square feet (24.78% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new driveway, new plantings, retaining walls, patios, walkways and new solid wood fencing at the side property lines on a vacant lot passed 3-0 subject to the following:

- 1) The project is subject to the TCLA comments via the administrative review procedures;
- 2) The landscape plan shall be revised with enhanced plantings at the front and right elevation and hardscape shall be revised for enhanced consistency in materials; and
- 3) The project shall be subject to all conditions listed in the preliminary approval by the SFPUC dated July 12, 2011.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

(Not public hearing items; Board comments only.)

New Houses

9. **515 Craig Road - Thorenfeldt (TRG Architects / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for preliminary review of the demolition of an existing residence and construction of a new two story French Country style residence of approximately 5,641 square feet (24.9% Floor Area Ratio) and conceptual landscape plan including new driveway entrance, new plantings, tree removal, new retaining walls and pathways.

Boardmember Wings acknowledged this was a neighborhood in transition; however, the proposal seemed to be out of scale with the remainder of the neighborhood. He complimented the style and the sweeping rooflines down to the first story, which assisted in reducing the mass. He recommended including shading and shadowing to show distances, setbacks and modulation of the design. He stated that the wall offsets should be increased and that although the style proposed was aesthetically pleasing, he was uncertain if it was appropriate for the site.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan stated the design was too imposing due to the existing topography of the site and existing neighborhood context. She noted the square footage would be increased

from approximately 2,071 square feet (existing house) to approximately 5,641 square feet and although the materials proposed were of high quality, the proposal was too large for the site.

Boardmember Tenenbaum noted that the proposal appeared to loom and may be too much before its time in the neighborhood. She added that although she appreciated the style and its charm, her main critique on the proposal was the size.

Chair Heine stated his appreciation for the design and style; however, he expressed concern with the size of the home. He added that increased wall offsets would be beneficial and the story poles would be an important aspect of the review. He recommended the opportunity be explored for additional half timbering.

10. **935 Chiltern Road - Miller (TRG Architects)**

Request for preliminary review of demolition of an existing single story ranch style residence and construction of a new two story English Arts & Crafts style residence of approximately 6,373 square feet (24.9% Floor Area Ratio) and conceptual landscape plan including new driveway surfacing, tree removal, new plantings, retaining walls and patio areas.

Boardmember Tenenbaum expressed support for the style proposed and recommended the garage door style be revisited for enhanced consistency with the style and the hardscape be refined to reduce its linear elements.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan stated the design was elegant without being superimposing. She commented on the number of windows at the rear elevation and concluded that the design was aesthetically pleasing.

Boardmember Winges stated this was a great opportunity to improve the site and was looking forward to seeing the finished product. He recommended the entry be revisited and simplified as it appeared to be large and very formal with the second level balcony.

Chair Heine complimented the style and the materials proposed including the wood shingle roof, wood panels on the windows and gables and corbel details. He recommended the applicant carry the details forward in the formal application and recommended the landscape plan be revisited to reduce the linear elements for a more fluid design.

11. **165 Woodridge Road - Chu (Richard Tapp & Associates / Bruce MacDonald Landscape)**

Request for third preliminary review of a new two level residence of approximately 14,388 square feet (15.0% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new plantings, retaining walls and driveway surfacing on a vacant lot.

Boardmember Winges welcomed the changes made since the previous preliminary review and expressed appreciation for the response letter. He expressed concern with the large rounded window feature at the front elevation and noted that the two story vertical element appeared to be overdone and massive. He recommended exploring the opportunity to incorporate details, such as a horizontal break to reduce massing. He added that the small improvements made a big difference and the design was more of a single family as opposed to multifamily, which was a concern at the previous preliminary review. He added that it was not clear on the plans as to which portions of the elevation were solid and which were open.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan stated the proposal appeared to be well integrated into the site with reduced grading on a difficult lot; however, she remained concerned with the size proposed. She asked for clarification on the green metal windows included in the design and noted that the project had come a long way since its initial review.

Boardmember Tenenbaum complimented the quality of materials and expressed her support for the design, noting that although the home was large, the lot was large as well and could accommodate the proposal.

Boardmember Winges noted that the landscape plan could be revised to include more structure in terms of the planting plan/design on the hillside.

Chair Heine expressed appreciation for the models and scale of trees, noting that the landscape plan included a substantial amount of information and detail; however, he appreciated the methods used to hide the driveway and was supportive of the side elevations of the house. He expressed interest in reviewing cross canyon view impacts and stated that the project was still large in terms of square footage proposed. He added that the integration of the proposal had been enhanced since the previous review and although he was supportive of the color and material board, he encouraged the applicant to make the palette as natural as possible.

DISCUSSION ITEM(S) – None

ADJOURNMENT – 6:00 pm

Minutes prepared by:



Serena Ponzo, Associate Planner