

TOWN OF HILLSBOROUGH

San Mateo County

Planning Office
(650) 375-7411
Fax (650) 375-7415

1600 Floribunda Avenue
Hillsborough, CA 94010



Architecture and Design Review Board APPROVED MINUTES

Monday, May 07, 2012 at 4:00 pm
Town Hall, 1600 Floribunda Avenue – Community Room

CALL TO ORDER – 4:00 PM

Boardmembers Present: Jerry Wings (Acting Chair); Nan Ryan; Julie Tenenbaum; Christian Huebner

Boardmembers Absent: Eric Nyhus (excused)

Staff Present: Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning; Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner; Tim Anderson, Acting Chief Building Official

Others Present: Councilmember Larry May (arrived at 4:20 pm)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion (Huebner / Tenenbaum) to approve the January 23, 2012 minutes passed 3:0:1 (Wings abstained)

A motion (Ryan / Wings) to approve the April 02, 2012 minutes passed 2:0:2 (Huebner & Tenenbaum abstained)

WRITTEN/ORAL COMMUNICATIONS – None.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

Acting Chair Wings announced and explained the appeals process to members of the public, which allows any decision of the ADRB to be appealed to the City Council within fifteen days of the ADRB decision. He added that all appeals must be filed with the City Clerk and provided a brief explanation of the purpose of the consent calendar.

Consent Items

Additions/Remodels

1. **25 Bridge Road - Lang (Nyhus Design Group)**

Request for replacement of existing roofing material from wood shake to "CertainTeed Presidential Shake" composition shingle. This is a revision to a previously approved ground floor addition, which was approved by the ADRB at the January 23, 2012 meeting.

A motion (Huebner / Ryan) to approve consent calendar item #1 passed 4:0.

Regular Items:

New Houses

2. **537 Craig Road - Williamson (Robert Williams Architect / Small Brown Landscape Architects)**

Continued review of the request for demolition of an existing two story residence and construction of a new two story Normandy style residence of approximately 7,073 square feet of floor area (22.9% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new front yard fencing, gates and columns, new plantings, new driveway surfacing, new patios, spa and retaining walls. *(Continued at the April 02, 2012 ADRB meeting)*

Robert Williamson, property owner, made a brief presentation to the ADRB and provided an overview of the architectural revisions that had been made since the April 02, 2012 ADRB meeting and that had been favorably received by the ADRB subcommittee (Boardmembers Winges and Ryan) on April 13, 2012. These architectural revisions included changes to the height of the entry roofline, which was decreased by approximately six feet and dropping of the eave across the front with incorporation of traditional arched dormers, to address comments with the massing. Flat roofed areas had been removed and refinements made to the rooflines at the right side of the residence to address ADRB comments from the April 02, 2012 meeting.

Ruth Brown, landscape architect, made a brief presentation on the landscaping plan, explained how the landscaping had been designed with the intent to reduce massing of the residence versus screening and requested to retain deciduous trees at the front entry; although the Town's Consulting Landscape Architect report had recommended an evergreen.

Acting Chair Winges opened the public hearing. As no members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Huebner asked if all soffits would have cast stone with wood banding.

Bob Williams, project architect, confirmed that all soffits would be designed in the manner, referencing the elevations, which were displayed on the screen.

Acting Chair Winges noted to the applicant that sheet A3.1 still illustrated the original detail, which had been revised to address ADRB comments in the current design.

Bob Williams, project architect, acknowledged the comment and noted it would be corrected on the plans.

Boardmember Ryan thanked the applicants for their response to ADRB comments and commended them on their efforts, noting it made for an improved project.

Boardmember Tenenbaum thanked the applicants for their efforts and stated that the revisions had enhanced the project's compatibility with the existing neighborhood context and reduced the massing. She complimented the design of the iron gates and project details.

Boardmember Huebner complimented the details of the project and the revisions made since the initial review.

Acting Chair Winges agreed with the Boardmembers, noting that the new rendering illustrated the changes made and told the story of the project. He added that the revisions had made a difference of the street elevation and project now displayed great consistency in detail and asked the applicants to insure the lighting at the entry gate did not create a glare.

A motion (Huebner / Tenenbaum) to approve the demolition of an existing two story residence and construction of a new two story Normandy style residence of approximately 7,073 square feet of floor area (22.9% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new front yard fencing, gates and columns, new plantings, new driveway surfacing, new patios, spa and retaining walls as submitted passed 4:0.

3. **501 Remillard Drive - Li / Ma (Stewart Associates / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Continued review of the request for demolition of an existing single story Ranch style residence and construction of a new two story English Country style residence of approximately 5,454 square feet of floor area (24.9% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new fencing, gates and columns along the street, new arbor, new plantings, new stone patio, perimeter fencing, landscape retaining walls and new driveway surfacing. (*Continued at the April 02, 2012 ADRB meeting*)

John Stewart, project architect, made a presentation on the changes made to the proposal including a reduction of overall height by two feet, a reduction in the number of dormers from four to three, increased the setback of the garage from the front property line by approximately five feet, which resulted in the creation of an arcade area on the first floor at the rear level. Additionally, a cast stone trim was added to the windows throughout, in lieu of a water table and presented the "good neighbor" agreement they had developed with the rear neighbors at 3780 Ralston Avenue.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, explained the changes made to the landscape plan to address neighbor concerns, which included additional Grecian laurels to be planted along the shared property line with 505 Remillard Drive in addition to two new trees planted on the 505 Remillard property to enhance screening. Additionally, the revised landscape plan included a new retaining wall along the rear property line. He explained the location of the retaining wall was based on the location of an existing five foot public utility easement. He noted that preliminary approval had been received from the Engineering Department for the open style fence at the front corner of the property adjacent to Ralston and Remillard Drive and made himself available to answer questions of the ADRB.

Acting Chair Winges opened the public hearing.

Cindy Chew, 505 Remillard Drive, distributed photos of the installed story poles (viewed from her rear yard) to the ADRB members and explained that she was originally pleased to hear that the number of dormers had been reduced from four to three until she understood that two of the

dormers would have balconies. She explained that she had discussed the option of an agreement with Galen Ma, property owner representative, to have minimum tree heights; however, his attorney had advised against it. She noted her preference for the trees to be at least nineteen feet in height to provide privacy screening and requested the ADRB reconsider the balcony features or require a larger tree be planted for screening purposes.

Acting Chair Winges asked if the dormers could be viewed from the pool at 505 Remillard.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, stated that the visibility was limited; however, there were gaps in the existing vegetation.

Acting Chair Winges inquired if a "good neighbor" agreement had been reached with 505 Remillard, noting that it appeared concerns could be addressed through such an agreement.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, confirmed that an agreement had not been attained; however, they had met with Ms. Chew to discuss her concerns and the landscape revisions.

Cindy Chew, 505 Remillard, confirmed that her concerns with the balconies would be addressed if larger trees were installed.

Galen Ma, owner representative, stated that an agreement was offered to the neighbor at 505 Remillard.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, explained the additional shrub plantings included in the landscape design, which would be understory plantings to the new trees installed for enhanced/layered screening.

Craig Storek, 3780 Ralston Avenue, explained that his main objection to the proposal was invasion of privacy. He confirmed that a signed agreement had been completed with the applicants. He acknowledged that the new dry stack retaining wall would be filled with a nursery mix and questioned if a more dense material could be used as fill.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, explained that this material would be compacted down and is regularly used as fill for retaining walls.

Craig Storek, 3780 Ralston Avenue, expressed his support for the proposal.

Duane Spence, 3665 Ralston Avenue, explained his intentions to appeal to the fairness and good nature of the ADRB. He added that a new home had been constructed at 506 Craig Road which directly impacted Cindy Chew and due to the fact that the proposal at 501 Remillard was located at the left side to her property, asked the Board to accommodate her requests for privacy and mitigate impacts to her home.

Donald Koppel, 3755 Ralston Avenue, agreed with Mr. Spences request to address concerns of 505 Remillard Drive and inquired on the fate of the existing trees and detail of new trees located at the front of 501 Remillard Drive, noting his property was located directly across the street.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, provided an overview of the proposed tree removal, landscaping (including shrub and tree installation along the street frontages) and new seven foot wood fence along the Ralston side of the property.

Acting Chair Wings closed the public hearing.

Boardmember Huebner noted massing was still present along the left side elevation. He added that the renderings were helpful in the project review, although he remained uncertain which measures would mitigate neighbor concerns at the rear corner of the property and remained uncertain of his position on the proposal.

Boardmember Tenenbaum acknowledged the applicants efforts for neighbor outreach, noting that change is difficult. She commended the landscape architect on his efforts to provide additional screening in the landscape plan to address neighbor concerns and the architect on his efforts to reduce the height and massing of the proposal. She added that the proposal seemed to fit well within the existing neighborhood context and that the applicants had done a great job working directly with the neighbors.

Boardmember Ryan expressed her appreciation for the changes and commended the applicants for their outreach efforts to the neighbors.

Acting Chair Wings expressed his support for the project revisions, inclusive of the new dormer design at the rear elevation. He encouraged the applicants to continue to work with Ms. Chew and noted that he would be supportive of the project with an agreement to be completed by the applicants and Ms. Chew.

John Stewart, project architect, informed the ADRB that the owner would be amenable to the installation of larger size trees to address Ms. Chew's concerns.

Boardmember Huebner clarified with Ms. Chew that her concerns would be allayed with the installation of larger size trees.

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, commented that one option was for the balcony size to be reduced and larger trees be installed to address neighbor concerns.

John Stewart, project architect, stated that a change to the balcony size would compromise the design of the roofline and house.

Cindy Chew, 505 Remillard Drive, confirmed that larger trees would address her concerns so long as they were at least fifteen feet high at the time of installation.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, confirmed that the installation of 36-inch box size trees should reach that height limit at the time of installation.

A motion (Ryan / Tenenbaum) to approve the demolition of an existing single story Ranch style residence and construction of a new two story English Country style residence of approximately 5,454 square feet of floor area (24.9% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new fencing, gates and columns along the street, new arbor, new plantings, new stone patio, perimeter fencing, landscape retaining walls and new driveway surfacing with the condition that the three new Grecian laurel trees along the shared property line with 505 Remillard, at the back corner, be increased to 36-inch box sizes, passed 4:0.

4. **385 Pinehill Road - Avedon / Kelly (Jon Lum Architecture, Inc. / Michael Callan Landscape Architect)**

Request for demolition of an existing single story residence and construction of a new two story Craftsman style residence (with Japanese influences) with a basement area of approximately 7,957 square feet of floor area (9.7% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, retaining walls, new secondary driveway, new patios, walkways and swimming pool. *(Received preliminary review at the March 05, 2012 ADRB meeting)*

Jon Lum, project architect, provided the ADRB with an overview of the project revisions which had been incorporated into the design since the preliminary review and included a shifting of the second level for a more centered approach to massing, shifted location for dormers, revised roof color, fire rated wood siding and new details of the windows incorporated into the plans. He explained the public outreach efforts made by the owners, specifically the changes made to windows and enhanced landscaping at the right side in response to neighbor concerns.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, addressed the TCLA comments in his presentation, explained that the story poles along the side property line represented the height of hedges and expressed the preference to retain the pine trees which were in good condition. He explained the trash enclosure design and that the patio stone would be an earth tone color.

Acting Chair Winges opened the public hearing.

Lynne Steventon, 400 Pullman Road, expressed her support for the proposal, noting the home would be an asset to the neighborhood. She expressed support for retention of the trees and the revised roof color.

Acting Chair Winges closed the public hearing.

Boardmember Tenenbaum thanked the owners for their public outreach efforts and for letting the natural features of the land dictate the design of the project. She expressed support for the project revisions and asked for lighting detail.

Boardmember Ryan commented that the home fit perfectly on the lot, would be an excellent family home and expressed her support for the revised roof color. She commended the efforts to centralize the massing through shifts of the second floor and questioned if the interior lighting would be visible from downhill properties. She added that the home would be visible when viewing from downhill; however, it remained an exciting project and well done.

Boardmember Huebner commended the applicants for the complete packet submitted and expressed his support for the proposal.

Acting Chair Winges expressed his support for the proposal.

A motion (Tenenbaum / Ryan) to approve demolition of an existing single story Ranch style residence and construction of a new two story English Country style residence of approximately 5,454 square feet of floor area (24.9% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new fencing, gates and columns along the street, new arbor, new plantings, new stone patio, perimeter fencing, landscape retaining walls and new driveway surfacing passed 4:0.

5. **1285 La Cumbre Road - Su (Lun Chan Associates / Land Planning Concepts)**

Request for demolition of an existing single story residence and construction of a new two story Italian Mediterranean style residence of approximately 5,432 square feet (18.3% Floor Area

Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new perimeter fencing, new driveway gates, retaining walls, new swimming pool, driveway surfacing and patios. *(Received preliminary review at the December 05, 2011 ADRB Meeting).*

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, disclosed that although Bruce Chan was not the Town's Consulting Landscape Architect, he has been used as a landscape consultant, by the Town for projects on an individual basis and as needed.

Erik Chan, project architect, introduced himself to the ADRB and provided a brief overview of the project's progress. He introduced landscape architect, Bruce Chan.

Bruce Chan, landscape architect, explained that to address concerns received from adjacent neighbor, Gemma Hon, 1280 La Cumbre Road, the existing fir tree at the front of the property could be retained in the landscape design. He explained the existing vegetation onsite, new retaining walls, new driveway gate proposed and an overview of the landscape materials.

Boardmember Huebner inquired if a pedestrian gate was included in the plan or had been considered.

Bruce Chan, landscape architect, stated that one was currently not included in the plan but could be provided.

Erik Chan, project architect, continued to explain the architectural style of the home, noting that homes in Italy had been studied as models for the proposal's massing and details. He explained the high quality materials included in the design and outlined the changes made to the proposal, including a size reduction, refinements to the exterior of the entry and stair tower, revisions to window details and locations and refinements made for enhanced consistency with the architectural style proposed. He added that the northwest corner of the residence had been revised to reduce building mass and expressed his appreciation for the ADRB comments.

Acting Chair Wings opened the public hearing.

Gemma Hon, 1280 La Cumbre Road, expressed her preference for the existing fir tree at the front of the property to remain as it would soften the impact of the new home. She explained that she had met with the applicants prior to the start of the meeting and they had agreed to keep the tree. She asked the Board to consider, in the even the fir tree is damaged, requiring a tree replacement of the same size and height.

Acting Chair Wings inquired if a thirty foot replacement tree was feasible.

Bruce Chan, landscape architect, stated that a 36-inch box to 48-inch box conifer tree would be approximately 22-ft in height at the time of installation.

Gemma Hon, 1280 La Cumbre Road, inquired if the replacement would take ten to twenty years to reach thirty feet in height.

Bruce Chan, landscape architect, noted that a 48-inch box conifer would be an appropriate replacement tree to reach a greater height at the time of installation.

Acting Chair Wings closed the public hearing.

Boardmember Huebner noted the applicants' presentation was helpful and expressed appreciation for the California Italian home style presented. Although he was supportive of the proposal, he recommended revisions to the driveway gate, as the design did not appear to be consistent with the architectural style proposed.

Boardmember Tenenbaum expressed support for the proposal and commented on the location of the window in the guest room at the lower level, which interrupted the location of the bed wall. She added that the proposed roof tile could have an inconsistent appearance when installed and recommended that the roof tile be revisited for a more aged, authentic appearance. She recommended the gate design be revisited and concluded that with the changes, the proposal would be a nice addition to the neighborhood.

Boardmember Ryan commended the applicants on the square footage reduction and driveway refinements. She noted the landscape plan execution would be critical and noted that the presentation and color & material board addressed her previous concerns with the proposed colors. She recommended the roof tile be revisited.

Acting Chair Wings expressed his appreciation for the positive changes incorporated into the design since the last review. He noted that the computer renderings provided in the packet appeared monochrome and his preference for the aesthetics of the plan elevations, specifically noting page A0.8. He added that the wood detail should contrast more with the stucco and that the landscape plan was appropriate for the site and proposed improvements.

A motion (Huebner / Tenenbaum) to approve the demolition of an existing single story residence and construction of a new two story Italian Mediterranean style residence of approximately 5,432 square feet (18.3% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new perimeter fencing, new driveway gates, retaining walls, new swimming pool, driveway surfacing and patios passed 4:0 with the following conditions:

- 1) The roof tile shall be revised, subject to review by Planning Staff;
- 2) The landscape shall be revised to address TCLA comments and front gate design shall be revisited, subject to review by Planning Staff;
- 3) The existing Fir tree located at the front of the property shall be maintained.

DISCUSSION ITEM(S)

6. DRAFT Design Guidelines Amendment: Chapter 8, Roofing Materials

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, provided the ADRB with the reasons for the changes to Chapter 8, Roofing Materials, of the design guidelines and noted that the proposed changes had been reviewed by a subcommittee of the ADRB, consisting of Acting Chair Wings and former ADRB Chair, Mark Heine.

Acting Chair Wings, explained that he and Mark Heine had worked together to review changes to this section of the design guidelines and at the end of this review felt these changes provided the flexibility in the materials available to applicants while retaining the expectation for high quality materials and design.

Boardmember Huebner discussed the patch and match situation and inquired if the revisions addressed this specifically in terms of when this should be considered.

Acting Chair Wings stated that review and consideration of those situations would be on a

case by case basis.

A motion (Ryan / Huebner) to recommend the proposed Design Guidelines Amendment: Chapter 8, Roofing Materials, be forwarded to the City Council for approval passed 4:0.

7. Project Updates

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, provided the ADRB with brief updates on the following projects:

- 1) 39 Glenbrook, proposal for a new multi-level residence, approved by the ADRB on March 05, 2012, was reviewed and approved by the City Council at the April 09, 2012 City Council meeting with a condition of approval requiring landscape screening to be reviewed by Planning Staff.
- 2) 130 Bridge Road, which was approved by the ADRB on August 1, 2011, would likely result in revisions to be reviewed by the ADRB at the June meeting.

ADJOURNMENT – 5:41 PM

Minutes prepared by:



Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner