

TOWN OF HILLSBOROUGH

San Mateo County

Planning Office
(650) 375-7411
Fax (650) 375-7415

1600 Floribunda Avenue
Hillsborough, CA 94010



Architecture and Design Review Board Approved Minutes

Monday, November 05, 2012 at 4:00 pm
Town Hall, 1600 Floribunda Avenue – Community Room

CALL TO ORDER – 4:00 PM

Boardmembers Present: Eric Nyhus, Chair; Jerry Wings; Julie Tenenbaum; Christian Huebner; Lionel Foster; Nan Ryan, Alternate

Boardmembers Absent: None.

Staff Present: Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning; Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner; Tim Anderson, Building Official.

Others Present: Councilmember Larry May (Building & Planning Council Commissioner)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion (Huebner / Foster) to approve the October 01, 2012 ADRB minutes passed 3:0:2 (Wings & Tenenbaum abstaining)

WRITTEN/ORAL COMMUNICATIONS – None.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

Chair Nyhus announced and explained the appeals process to members of the public, which allows any decision of the ADRB to be appealed to the City Council within fifteen days of the ADRB decision. He added that all appeals must be filed with the City Clerk and provided a brief explanation of the purpose of the consent calendar.

Consent Items

Additions/Remodels

1. **1570 Kingswood Drive - D'Ull (Donna Warrington Architect)**
Request for a ground floor addition of approximately 873 square feet of floor area (17.90% Floor Area Ratio) to the rear/right portion of an existing one story ranch style residence and the

addition of a new bay window at the front of the residence.

A motion (Tenenbaum / Huebner) to approve the consent calendar passed 5:0.

Regular Items:

New Houses

2. **101 Bella Vista Drive - Yang (David Wong Design / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for review of demolition of an existing split level residence and construction of a new multi-level French Country style residence of approximately 6,905 square feet of floor area (23.5% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new retaining walls, tree removal, new plantings, new sports court, new front yard fencing and driveway gates, water features, outdoor BBQ and fire pit. *(Received 2nd preliminary review at the August 06, 2012 ADRB Meeting)*

David Wong, project designer, made a brief presentation to the ADRB and explained the changes incorporated into the plans since the second preliminary review, which included a reduction in the height of the center entrance element, realignment of the windows on the first and upper levels and insuring the mullion patterns of the windows were consistent throughout.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, thanked Planning Staff for the efforts in arranging an onsite meeting with adjacent neighbor at 10 Fawn Court and that they were agreeable to the conditions listed pertaining to customized location of screening after the sports court installation as well as restricting trenching within the dripline of the existing mature trees along the shared property line.

Chair Nyhus opened the public hearing. As no members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Huebner thanked the applicant for the clean and organized submittal. He added that the current design fit well with the style and scale of other new homes in the area and that the proposal retained high quality materials and was now consistent and balanced throughout the elevations. He added that the proposed landscaping was appropriate to the topography of the site and expressed his support for the proposal.

Boardmember Winges stated that the project had evolved nicely and plan set was complete and easy to navigate with adequate detail. He added that the proposal fit well within the existing neighborhood context with good site circulation proposed. He noted that the dropped eaves aided in reducing the mass and that the design was appropriate to the site and consistent in detail. He commented on the gate design and its consistency with the main residence and expressed support for the proposal.

Boardmember Tenenbaum acknowledged the improvements to the packet detail, presentation and the applicants' responsiveness to the ADRB's previous comments in addition to the challenging features of the lot. She noted that the parking circulation proposed may be confusing for guests and mentioned the high quality materials included in the proposal.

Boardmember Foster expressed his support for the proposal and appreciation for the applicants' proactive approach with the concerned neighbor. He added that the current design was responsive to the ADRB's previous comments and the size and quality of the home were appropriate to the site.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan noted that location of the washer and dryer on the upper floor would be helpful for the occupants, complimented the improvements made to the plans and expressed her support for the proposal.

Chair Nyhus noted his continued concerns with the arches and some of the dormers; however, he added that overall the project had been improved. He mentioned the upper level mullion pattern on the left, which seemed to be more horizontal in design and which could be changed.

A motion (Winges/Huebner) to approve the demolition of an existing split level residence and construction of a new multi-level French Country style residence of approximately 6,905 square feet of floor area (23.5% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new retaining walls, tree removal, new plantings, new sports court, new front yard fencing and driveway gates, water features, outdoor BBQ and fire pit passed 5:0 with the following conditions:

- 1) Project be subject to TCLA comments via the administrative procedures
- 2) Final placement of the landscape screening along the shared property line shall be coordinated with 10 Fawn Court, after installation of the sports court, subject to the administrative review procedures
- 3) No trenching shall occur within the dripline of the existing trees along the shared property line with 10 Fawn Court. Should any movement of earth be required in this area, hand digging shall be permitted and according to the arborist's recommendations.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

(Not public hearing items; Board comments only.)

New Houses

3. **5 Santa Maria Lane - Zhang-Jian (TRG Architects / Michael Callan Landscape)**
Request for preliminary review of the demolition of an existing split level residence and construction of a new two story French style residence of approximately 6,923 square feet of floor area (23.7% Floor Area Ratio) and associated conceptual landscape plan including a new driveway cut along West Santa Inez, new plantings, tree removal, new paving, patios and new swimming pool.

Boardmember Foster acknowledged the ambition of the project, which would replace a one and a half story home and the concerns of the neighbor pertaining to the similarity of style and turning the residence to face West Santa Inez Avenue. He commented that due to the existing neighborhood context, turning the home to face Santa Maria Lane was not preferred due to the size of the proposal. He added that differentiation with the proposed style would be challenging; however, it could possibly be achieved through increased setbacks and adjustments in the locations of screening.

Boardmember Tenenbaum noted a section from the Town's Residential Design Guidelines, which states that no two homes should appear to have been built by the same developer. She added that the home adjacent to the project site at 262 West Santa Inez Avenue was 2.25 acres or more and expressed her concerns with the size and mass of the proposed new residence. She inquired on the fate of the two power poles which are located at the front of the property along West Santa Inez Avenue. She noted that the story poles would be an important element in

assessing the proposal and that she was looking forward to reviewing the plans for the revised driveway. She recommended lowering and softening the proposal.

Boardmember Winges stated that the massiveness and extreme formality of the proposal were not appropriate for the lot size and that a home of this caliber deserved a larger lot overall. He inquired on the purpose of the carport and why it was not a garage. He expressed support for the central driveway design and noted that reducing the roof height of the two garage sections could differentiate the project from the adjacent property at 262 West Santa Inez Avenue along with an increase in the setbacks.

Boardmember Huebner agreed with the other Boardmembers and recommended the home be setback further on the lot. He noted the architectural authenticity of the design and questioned the potential impacts which could occur to the existing oak tree near the new garage location. He also inquired on the purpose of the carport and stated that a garage would be more consistent with the proposal. He recommended revisiting the plan inconsistencies including the empty panels seen on the elevations and the mudroom door.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan agreed with the other Boardmembers and noted the design was beautiful and recommended incorporation of a belly band around the exterior, which could aid in breaking up the mass and differentiate the design. She recommended preservation of the existing oak trees and was supportive of the West Santa Inez entrance (turning from Santa Maria Lane to West Santa Inez). She expressed concern with the size of the proposal and the rear yard structures proposed which were not included on the plans.

Chair Nyhus note that the two accessory buildings in the rear yard should be included in the plans for review and although the home was beautifully designed, he noted there were many tall, empty spaces throughout. He explained the purpose of Floor Area Ratio (FAR) and how it controls massing. He recommended the proposal be revisited and the overall heights reduced, lower the garage wings (perhaps with a flat roof) and reduce the size. He recommended that the center portion of the residence be left as the focal point of the proposal and noted that as presented, the home was too large for the site.

4. **620 Darrell Road - Gujral / Sayage (TRG Architects)**

Request for preliminary review of demolition of an existing single story ranch style residence and construction of a new two story English Country style residence of approximately 5,579 square feet of floor area (23.8% Floor Area Ratio).

Boardmember Winges stated he was not able to access the rear yard, but acknowledged the poor condition of the existing residence and the need for property improvements. He noted the footprint of the new residence was appropriate to the site and acknowledged the efforts made through design to minimize impacts to the right side neighbor. He noted that the style contrasted with the existing homes in the neighborhood and could benefit from a reduced roof ridge height and reduced scale, specifically at the front elevation. He recommended the design be revisited for a reduced scale and toned down design, which could be accomplished through hipped roofs, lower slopes and additional horizontal treatments.

Boardmember Huebner agreed with Boardmember Winges and expressed appreciation for the proposed improvements to the site. He complimented the floor plan and noted that the elevations, as presented, were sparse and would benefit from enhanced detail including rafter tails and corbels under the windows.

Boardmember Tenenbaum also stated she was not able to access the rear yard and her preference to do so. She expressed support for the design with additional architectural enhancements such as lanterns, fixtures and a landscape plan. She noted that the backup distance of twenty five feet proposed, although it met the Town's requirements, may present very limited space for vehicle access and circulation and she recommended revisiting this aspect of the design.

Boardmember Foster noted review of the landscape plan would be important and screening would be a key element in the project design. He added that the project was sited appropriately with adequate distances from neighbors and was curious about the juniper replacements at the street frontage of the property.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan noted that the story poles would be key in review of the design and that the topography of the site presented challenges. She remained curious about the massing and noted the front entry, as proposed, lacked a covering and any kind of recess.

Chair Nyhus stated that the project was off to a good start and the story poles would reveal massing issues or impacts to surrounding properties. He recommended revisiting the scale of the project and reducing.

5. **645 Hillsborough Blvd. - Dwyer (Lara Architecture / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for preliminary review of the demolition of an existing single story ranch style residence and construction of a new two story French Manor style residence of approximately 6,511 square feet of floor area (24.86% Floor Area Ratio) and associated conceptual landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new drystack stone retaining walls, new fencing and gates and patios. The proposal also includes a new driveway entrance along Seabury Road.

Boardmember Tenenbaum expressed her support for the proposal and noted the landscaping was appropriate to the site. She added that the proposed style worked well in the neighborhood as it was complementary but not too similar.

Boardmember Foster expressed support for the design, noting it was a great improvement to the site.

Boardmember Huebner stated the proposal fit well within the existing neighborhood and design was authentic to the architectural style. He expressed support for the Seabury entrance and although the dining room window appeared to be large and possibly out of place, the project was headed in the right direction.

Boardmember Winges complimented the rendering presented and the one story detached garage structure. He expressed his support for the property improvements and noted that the massing at the corner of Hillsborough Blvd. and Seabury could be an issue and recommended insuring the empty volumes on the second level were usable space.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan expressed her support for the proposal and complimented the conservatory windows at the rear elevation. She noted the wide hallways used on the interior, the elegance of the design and the compatibility of the design with the existing neighborhood context.

Chair Nyhus noted that the shutters served a purpose and they were lost in the design as you wrap around to the rear elevation, although he understood the reason from a design standpoint. He commented on the prominent homes seen along Hillsborough, supported the reorientation of the home to have a Seabury Road entrance and that the screening would be important along Hillsborough Blvd. to create a "green corridor". He noted the high quality materials of the design, authentic thick walls, the unique rear elevation design and the great start for the project.

DISCUSSION ITEM(S)

6. Distribution of final 2013 ADRB Calendar

The ADRB members received copies of the 2013 ADRB Calendar, which would also be posted on the Town's website and on all boards in Town prior to December 1, 2012.

ADJOURNMENT- 4:55 PM

Minutes Prepared By:



Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner