

# TOWN OF HILLSBOROUGH

San Mateo County

Planning Office  
(650) 375-7411  
Fax (650) 375-7415

1600 Floribunda Avenue  
Hillsborough, CA 94010



## Architecture and Design Review Board Approved Minutes

Monday, May 06, 2013 at 4:00 pm  
Town Hall, 1600 Floribunda Avenue – Community Room

### CALL TO ORDER – 4:00 PM

Boardmembers Present: Julie Tenenbaum, Acting Chair; Jerry Wingses; Christian Huebner; Lionel Foster; Nan Ryan, Alternate

Boardmembers Absent: Eric Nyhus, Chair (excused)

Staff Present: Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning; Ray Yniguez, Senior Inspector; Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner

Others Present: Councilmember Larry May, Building & Planning Council Commissioner

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion (Huebner / Wingses) to approve the March 25, 2013 meeting minutes passed 4:0.

WRITTEN/ORAL COMMUNICATIONS – None.

### PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

Acting Chair Tenenbaum announced and explained the appeals process to members of the public, which allows any decision of the ADRB to be appealed to the City Council within fifteen days of the ADRB decision. He added that all appeals must be filed with the City Clerk and provided a brief explanation of the purpose of the consent calendar.

.

### **Consent Items**

Additions/Remodels

1. **1050 Black Mountain Road – Irvin (Bergman Design)**  
Request for a second floor addition of approximately 194 square feet of floor area (21.5% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story residence. The proposal includes an enlargement of an

existing, legal nonconforming corner of the main residence at the front left side.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum announced that the item would be pulled from consent.

Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner, introduced the property owners and applicants, Bob and Andrea Irvin, who would be making a brief presentation to the ADRB. She indicated that a letter had been received from the adjacent neighbor, Tom Broderick of 1096 Whitwell Road indicating his withdrawal of concerns with the addition so long as the new sycamore tree is planted.

Andrea Irvin, property owner, made a presentation to the ADRB, provided background on the efforts they have made to obtain neighbor sign off and their desire to rescind their agreement with the adjacent neighbor to plant a new sycamore tree. She added that due to the nonconformities of the proposal, they attempted to resolve concerns early in the process with their neighbor and had not received a response in two months' time. She indicated their preference to receive review by the City Council as the next step in the process for expanding and altering a non-conforming building.

As no additional members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Foster inquired if planting the tree would obstruct the remainder of the yard from being utilized.

Andrea Irvin, property owner, indicated it would not.

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building and Planning, explained to the ADRB and members of the public that if the tree is not planted, there would be an outstanding concern with the project and due to the non-conforming aspect of the proposal, City Council review would be required.

Boardmember Winges indicated that trees are often used to address concerns with additions and recommended the tree be planted.

Boardmember Huebner concurred with the tree planting, specifically since the neighbor agreement had been received.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan concurred with the tree planting.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum expressed her frustration with the situation and situations in which projects are delayed due to lack of neighbor participation.

A motion (Huebner / Winges) to approve the second floor addition of approximately 194 square feet of floor area (21.5% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story residence, which includes the enlargement of an existing, legal nonconforming corner of the main residence at the front left side, passed 3:1 (Tenenbaum opposed), with the following condition:

- 1) *One, 24" box size, Bloodgood Plane tree (similar to the existing Sycamore trees) shall be planted along the fence line, in between the existing Bloodgood Plane trees that are adjacent to Whitwell Road. This 24" box size tree shall be planted prior start of construction of the second story addition, to the satisfaction of the Building Official. The new Bloodgood Plane tree should reach a height of at least 12 feet within three years of planting.*

**Regular Items:**

New Houses

2. **2785 Summit Drive - Kameda (Ana Williamson Architect / Keith Willig Landscape Architecture)**

Request for the demolition of an existing single story residence and construction of a new single level modern style residence of approximately 4,783 square feet of floor area (20.8% Floor Area Ratio), single level detached second unit and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new patios, driveway surfacing, entry walkway, water feature, spa, retaining walls, outdoor play structure and fencing. *(Received preliminary review at the March 04, 2013 ADRB meeting)*

Roberta Kameda, property owner, made a brief presentation to the ADRB, explained the project objectives and thanked Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner, for working closely with her design team through the process.

Ana Williamson, project architect, presented the changes incorporated into the design as a result of the preliminary review and which included a complete teardown of the existing residence, re-siting of the new residence and summarized the design of the home.

Keith Willig, landscape architect, explained the simple, natural palette of materials used in the landscape design, inclusive of bio-swales. He explained that traditional lawn was not used and an effort was made to include low maintenance, drought tolerant plant materials. He noted that the tree removal included acacias and eucalyptus trees, which would also enhance view opportunities. He added that the landscape plan included enhancements to the existing orchard for a productive landscape area.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum opened the public hearing.

Bruce Simon, 5 Patton Place, stated that his wife, Carolyn, had attended the public outreach meeting held by the applicant and that she resided directly across the street from the project site. He expressed concerns with visibility of the new residence and removal of the existing hedge which currently provides ample screening of the existing residence.

As no additional members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Foster complimented the plan packet and design revisions, which were responsive to the ADRB preliminary review comments and integrated landscape and architectural improvements on a prominent corner lot. He acknowledged that the architectural style was not too bold, maintained the character of the neighborhood and included design elements true to the modern style. He recommended the applicants work directly with Mr. Simon, 5 Patton Place, to address his concerns through landscape enhancements. He expressed support for the proposal.

Boardmember Huebner complimented the submittal package and project improvements. He commented on the addition and undulation of exterior materials of the walls which was improved and expressed one concern with the lack of windows along the right side elevation. He expressed support for the proposal specifically noting the high quality materials and accurate references to 50's and 60's architecture.

Boardmember Wingses complimented the completeness of the submittal package, noting it was one of the most complete he had reviewed. He suggested a change of address to Patton Place and expressed support for the changes made to the configuration of the house on the property. He acknowledged that the proposal exceeded the required setback distances at the front and the garage was well screened. He recommended the applicants use caution when selecting the metal roof to insure it has an elegant aesthetic appearance. He complimented the use of clerestory windows as well as the overall design for one level living. He expressed support for the proposal and thanked the applicants for their responsive project revisions. He inquired with Staff on the connection between existing parking strips in the area for enhanced pedestrian access.

Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner, stated that in the past, connectivity of existing and new parking strips has been preferred for enhanced pedestrian safety and access. She indicated this had not been reviewed by the Engineering Department; however, this could be included as a condition of approval for the project.

Boardmember Wingses inquired with the applicant if additional screening could be explored to address neighbor comment.

The applicants indicated they would be able to explore incorporating additional screening in the plan to address neighbor concern.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan complimented the complete and detailed packet submitted. She stated the proposal exuded understated elegance and authenticity. She acknowledged the responsiveness of the changes to the ADRB preliminary review comments and expressed support for the proposal.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum expressed support for the improvements, noting that the architecture and landscaping were well integrated. She added that the proposal was appropriate to the neighborhood but diverse and interesting. She complimented the design of the backyard area, which included several high quality materials and textures.

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building and Planning, provided the ADRB with an overview of the potential conditions of approval explored during the project discussion which included exploring connectivity between existing parking strips for pedestrian access and enhanced landscaping to address concerns of adjacent neighbor, Bruce Simon of 5 Patton Place.

A motion (Huebner / Foster) to approve the demolition of an existing single story residence and construction of a new single level modern style residence of approximately 4,783 square feet of floor area (20.8% Floor Area Ratio), single level detached second unit and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new patios, driveway surfacing, entry walkway, water feature, spa, retaining walls, outdoor play structure and fencing, passed 4:0 with the following conditions:

1. The project shall be subject to the Town's Consulting Landscape Architect (TCLA), whose comments shall be incorporated into the Building Permit set of plans with cursory review by Planning Staff;
2. Connection of the parking strips with a pedestrian path or additional parking strip area shall be explored and incorporated into the plans as required by the Engineering

Department and Planning Division;

3. The applicants shall coordinate with the adjacent neighbor at 5 Patton Place for resolution of screening concerns through an enhanced screening/planting plan.

3. **2010 Geri Lane - Geri Lane Development LP (Hunt Hale Jones Architect / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for demolition of an existing ranch style residence and construction of a new two story Colonial style residence of approximately 6,189 square feet of floor area (15.2% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new plantings, tree removal, new driveway surfacing, new fencing, patios & walkways. *(Received second preliminary review at the March 25, 2013 ADRB Meeting)*

Acting Chair Tenenbaum recused herself from review of the project due to her involvement with the Hillsborough Beautification Foundation and left the room. Boardmember Huebner was appointed as Acting Chair for review of the item.

Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner, provided a summary of the public comment letters received after the ADRB packet delivery, two of which were in support of the proposal and one which expressed concerns on potential impacts to the Geri Lane gates, including the following:

- Public comment from Marvin K. Lewis, owner of 2020 Geri Lane, expressed concerns with the size and proximity to the Geri Lane gates;
- Public comment from Heidi & Jay Leupp of 2045 Geri Lane, expressing support for the project;
- Public comment from Philip Malouf, Hillsborough resident, expressing support for the project.

She noted that copies of the public comment letters were distributed to the ADRB members prior to the meeting and copies were available for members of the public at the back of the room as well.

Dick Hunt, project architect, provided an overview of the architectural changes made since the March 25<sup>th</sup> preliminary review and explained the extended outreach efforts which had been completed. He mentioned comments received from the Hillsborough Beautification Foundation, which indicated their appreciation for the efforts to improve drainage; however, it was not an expression of support for the proposal. He clarified that the plate height of the lower floor was eleven feet high, not the ceiling height.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, stated that efforts continued for coordination of planting materials with the Hillsborough Beautification Foundation. He explained the revisions made to the landscape plan to comply with the Town's Biological Consultant recommendations due to the project's proximity to the creek.

Boardmember Winges commented on the project's proximity to the gates, specifically that the gates wanted to belong to the street, not to the house. He added that the more screening included in the landscape plan, the better.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, discussed the mix of plantings, including redwood trees, evergreens and that the applicants remained happy to continue coordinating efforts with the Hillsborough Beautification Foundation (HBF).

Boardmember Winges recommended filling in the gaps between the blue trees and liquidambar noted on the plans with additional screening.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, confirmed that the existing liquidambar were planted by the Geri Lane Home Owners Association and the goal was to replicate and complement the existing screening.

Dick Hunt, project architect, explained to the ADRB that Staff had informed him of a comment received regarding the proximity of the study to the gates and the resident had recommended reducing the size of the study. He explained the complexities in reworking the floor plan, specifically due to the location of the hallway and noted that the public benefit of achieving two additional feet of space was not as great as the impacts the change would have to the design.

Acting Chair Huebner opened the public hearing.

Dennis Trimble, 2140 Geri Lane, expressed concerns regarding recent tree removal completed at the Geri Lane gates, additional tree removal and that adequate size redwood trees would be needed as replacements.

Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner, explained that there was recently tree removal which occurred as a part of the Public Works project, which was not associated with this project. She stated that this tree removal occurred on both sides of the Geri Lane gates.

Boardmember Winges acknowledged that the residence had been moved back quite far from its original location and expressed appreciation for the coverage diagram, which demonstrated the footprint patterns of adjacent homes on the street. He indicated the proposal appeared to have a comparable footprint to surrounding homes. He stated that although the home appeared tall and boxy, it was true to the architectural style proposed. He added that the overall height of the home is inherent to the Colonial style, which was executed consistently throughout. He recommended the applicants work with HBF on enhanced screening to insure the screening of the house from the Geri Lane gates is adequate. He expressed his support for the project.

Boardmember Foster stated that the massing was appropriate to the site and surroundings. He noted that landscaping was needed on both sides of the gates and the project details remained authentic to the Colonial style proposed. He recommended the landscape screening be reviewed administratively.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan commented on the accuracy of the proposal to the Colonial style, which made her think of the East Coast. She added that the proposed proportions were excellent and was glad to hear the ceiling heights were 10-feet. She complimented the revisions made since the last preliminary review on March 25<sup>th</sup>.

Acting Chair Huebner acknowledged the very complete package and noted that the entry columns still appeared large for the space. He noted the very high quality materials and the consistent application of materials and elements of the Colonial Revival style used on the residence. He recommended that the applicants remain in close contact with the Town, including the Town's biological consultant for the project. He expressed his appreciation to the applicants for working so closely with the community, as it resulted in a better project.

A motion (Winges / Foster) to approve the demolition of an existing ranch style residence and construction of a new two story Colonial style residence of approximately 6,189 square feet of floor area (15.2% Floor Area Ratio) and associated landscape plan including new plantings, tree removal, new driveway surfacing, new fencing, patios & walkways, passed 3:0, with the following conditions:

1. The landscape plan shall be subject to the TCLA comments, subject to the administrative review process;
2. The landscape plan shall receive final review from the Town's Biological Consultant, at the cost of the applicant and shall include creek protection measures, to be implemented prior to the commencement of construction and for the duration of construction, subject to the administrative review process;
3. The applicants shall coordinate with the Geri Lane Homeowners Association and Hillsborough Beautification Foundation on an enhanced screening plan (dense vegetation) of the house from the Geri Lane Gates, which shall be submitted to the Planning Division.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum entered the room after the motion passed.

#### Additions/Remodels

4. **1050 Vista Drive - Harris (Winges Architects Inc. / Michael Callan Landscape Architect)**  
Request for a remodel, first and second floor addition of approximately 3,885 square feet of net new floor area (23.8% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story Spanish Colonial Revival style residence and associated landscape plan including a new concrete paver auto court, tree removal, new plantings, new patios, new swimming pool and new pathways. The proposal includes the addition of a new detached second unit above the proposed garage and continuation of an existing legal non-conforming setback along Chiltern Road. *(Received preliminary review at the March 04, 2013 ADRB Meeting)*

Boardmember Winges recused himself from review of the project as he is the project architect, and left the room.

Jim Harris, property owner, made a brief presentation to the ADRB, explained the refinements made to the project since the preliminary review on March 4<sup>th</sup>, their respect for the community character and the reasons for preserving the existing residence.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, made a brief presentation to the ADRB and provided clarification on the discrepancy in the landscape plan, as it did not include the location of the eucalyptus tree which exists in the right of way along Chiltern. He requested that they be permitted to apply for removal of the tree through the administrative review procedures.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum opened the public hearing. As no members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner, provided an update to the ADRB on the public comment/inquiry received from neighbor, Jim Rochotte, who expressed support of the eucalyptus tree removal and for the project as well.

Boardmember Foster applauded the applicant's efforts for restoring the residence and expressed his full support for the project.

Boardmember Huebner thanked the applicants for the complete submittal package and acknowledged that as a result of the additions, the mass would be increased on the South elevation; however, this portion of the residence is located well below the site line as it is a single level area. He expressed appreciation for the recycling of materials and acknowledged the positive improvements made to the project design since the March 4<sup>th</sup> preliminary review.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan concurred with the other Boardmembers, noting the enhanced project details. She acknowledged the high quality materials included in the design, commended the reuse of existing materials and expressed her full support for the proposal.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum expressed her full support for retaining and restoring the existing residence. She added that the changes made to the design were simply for refinement and she congratulated the applicants on fantastic design execution.

A motion (Foster / Huebner) to approve the remodel, first and second floor addition of approximately 3,885 square feet of net new floor area (23.8% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story Spanish Colonial Revival style residence, associated landscape plan including a new concrete paver auto court, tree removal, new plantings, new patios, new swimming pool and new pathways, the addition of a new detached second unit above the proposed garage and continuation of an existing legal non-conforming setback along Chiltern Road, passed 3:0 with the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall submit an administrative landscape application for the removal of the existing eucalyptus tree along Chiltern Road, inclusive of adjacent neighbor notification.

## **PRELIMINARY REVIEW**

**(Not public hearing items; Board comments only.)**

### New Houses

5. **225 Robin Road - Selmoni (MAK Studio)**

Request for preliminary review of the demolition of an existing split level ranch style home and construction of a new two story Modern style residence of approximately 11,647 square feet of floor area (13% Floor Area Ratio).

Boardmember Huebner noted the project would benefit from enhanced elevations, renderings and clarification in the details, noting the plans were difficult to read. He added that the home was well sited the size was appropriate to the site and neighborhood. He questioned the roof material used on the home and its visibility from Robin Road, due to the topography of the area. He acknowledged the high quality materials and noted the modern style was well executed. He recommended the gates be changed and stated that the landscape improvements would be critical to the project review.

Boardmember Winges stated the perspectives included in the plans were helpful; however, more detail was needed. He added that a 3D model would be helpful with this project. He acknowledged the long plane of the top of the house and questioned the roofing material which

would be used, and if the roof would be visible from neighboring properties or the street. He complimented the entry progression and noted the importance of the courtyard in the design. He inquired on the methods which would be used to reduce noise associated with the Town's Corporation Yard, which was adjacent to the property at the rear yard. He recommended that care be taken with the heights of the upper level roof areas.

Boardmember Foster stated the landscape plan would be a key part of the project details and review, specifically as it relates to the Corporation Yard and screening the roof from view. He recommended a changing of the existing driveway gates and providing enhanced details of the project walls. He added that the home was appropriate to the lot size and area.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan requested that a larger font for the details be used in future plan sets. She commented on the existing neighborhood context and that the home was appropriate in size and scale. She added that the design retained horizontality, consistent with the Modern style proposed. She encouraged the applicants to continue to refine the design and noted that the landscape plan would be a critical part of the review.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum stated that the home was an appropriate size for the area and agreed that the plan font size was too small. She noted the importance of changing of the driveway gates for consistency with the style of the home and recommended that the applicants work with the Town to develop options for shielding the Corporation Yard.

**DISCUSSION ITEM(S)** - None.

**ADJOURNMENT** – 5:51 PM

Minutes prepared by:



Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner