

TOWN OF HILLSBOROUGH

San Mateo County

Planning Office
(650) 375-7411
Fax (650) 375-7415

1600 Floribunda Avenue
Hillsborough, CA 94010



Architecture and Design Review Board APPROVED MINUTES

Tuesday, September 03, 2013 at 4:00 pm
Town Hall, 1600 Floribunda Avenue – Community Room

CALL TO ORDER – 4:00 PM

Boardmembers Present: Eric Nyhus, Chair; Jerry Wings; Julie Tenenbaum; Lionel Foster; Nan Ryan, Alternate

Boardmembers Absent: Christian Huebner (excused)

Staff Present: Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning; Serena Nevarez, Associate Planner; Ray Yniguez, Senior Building Inspector/Plan Checker

Others: Councilmember Larry May (Council Commissioner)

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion (Wings / Foster) to approve the July 01, 2013 & August 05, 2013 ADRB Meeting Minutes passed 3:0:1 (Tenenbaum abstained)

WRITTEN/ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Chair Nyhus announced and explained the appeals process to members of the public, which allows any decision of the ADRB to be appealed to the City Council within fifteen days of the ADRB decision. He added that all appeals must be filed with the City Clerk and provided a brief explanation of the purpose of the consent calendar.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

Consent Items

Additions/Remodels

1. **2260 Skyfarm Drive - Sherstinsky / Kelman (Strathdee Design & Development)**
Request for design review of a main level addition of approximately 682 square feet of floor area (18.1% Floor Area Ratio) and associated facade improvements including the addition of clerestory windows, dormers and redesigned entry for an enhanced contemporary architectural

style.

2. **20 Del Monte Drive - Rocha / Ching (Melinamade Interiors)**

Request for design review of a first and second floor addition of approximately 814 square feet of floor area (17.3% Floor Area Ratio) to an existing two story residence.

A motion (Foster / Tenenbaum) to approve the consent calendar items with the condition that both projects at 2260 Skyfarm Drive and 20 Del Monte Drive be subject to the Standard Conditions of Approval passed 4:0.

Regular Items:

Landscape Plans

3. **60 Buckeye Court (APN: 031-250-180 / Lot #5 Buckeye Court) - Kong (Peter E. Callander ASLA Landscape Architect)**

Request for review of a finalized landscape plan, as required by the ADRB at the March 25, 2013 ADRB meeting, which includes a reconfigured rear porch area, enhanced detail in the landscape plan identification of landscape materials. *(This landscape plan is associated with the approval of a new multi-level Spanish Mediterranean style residence of approximately 7,388 square feet (7.9% Floor Area Ratio), approved by the ADRB at the March 25, 2013 ADRB meeting)*

Ben Kong, property owner and applicant, made a brief presentation to the ADRB on the additional details included in the revised landscape plan and made himself available to answer any questions. He noted the continued efforts to work with the adjacent neighbors at 35 Via Delizia.

Melody Summers, 35 Via Delizia, stated that she was in full support of the landscape plan and project overall.

Chair Nyhus opened the public hearing. As no additional members of the public were present to speak, the public hearing was closed.

Boardmember Foster commended the efforts of the applicant and neighbors on resolving issues collaboratively to protect neighboring views and reduce impacts associated with the project. He stated the efforts made for an improved project and he expressed his support for the proposal.

Boardmember Tenenbaum complimented the entry details and supported the TCLA comments regarding the upsizing of trees and shrubs. She commended the applicants for their outreach and efforts made with the neighbors.

Boardmember Winges complimented the agreements made amongst neighbors, patio reconfiguration, understated entry, details of the landscape, inclusive of the urns and retaining walls. He expressed his support for the proposal.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan concurred with the Boardmembers and complimented the responsiveness of the plans to neighbor concerns, specifically the buffer zone provided between properties. She noted the plan's consistency with the Residential Design Guidelines and complimented the retention of tree #16 and the understated elegance of the proposal.

Chair Nyhus noted that good compromises were made through project revisions to address concerns with neighboring views and the landscaping was meant to make the house feel as if it

has always been there.

Elizabeth Cullinan, Director of Building & Planning, provided an overview of recommended conditions of approval to be incorporated into the motion which address TCLA comments and concerns relating to the location of plantings on the neighboring property at 35 Via Delizia.

A motion (Winges/Tenenbaum) to approve design review of a finalized landscape plan including a reconfigured rear porch area, enhanced detail in the landscape plan identification of landscape materials, passed 4:0 with the following conditions:

- 1) The landscape plan be subject to the TCLA Comments via the administrative review procedures;
- 2) The 8 plants proposed for screening on 35 Via Delizia be relocated closer to the shared property line with 60 Buckeye Court;
- 3) The three palms be revised to be flowering cherry trees;
- 4) Future revisions to the project design that are substantial in nature are subject to review and approval by the ADRB in a public hearing; minor revisions will be subject to review and approval via Administrative Review by staff.

As the motion was passed, the applicant and neighbor exited Council Chambers together as the issues and concerns previously expressed had all been resolved.

New Houses

4. **1441 Carlton Road - Lim (Nyhus Design Group / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Continued review of the request for design review of a new Transitional style residence of approximately 4,637 square feet of floor area (24.90% Floor Area Ratio), including a lower level and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new driveway design (secondary driveway), new patios, retaining walls and perimeter fencing. The proposal includes demolition of the existing single story residence. *(Project continued at the August 05, 2013 ADRB Meeting)*

Chair Nyhus recused himself from review of the proposal as the project architect and Boardmember Winges was appointed as Acting Chair. Chair Nyhus left the room.

Jeanne Davis, representing Nyhus Design Group, made a brief presentation to the ADRB and outlined the classification of the project as a new home, adjusted shape of the rear patio area, issues related to replacement of the neighbor's fence and the request that no additional requirements or restrictions be imposed on the proposal, as had been requested by the adjacent property owner.

Boardmember Tenenbaum inquired if switching the rear patio and lawn areas had been considered.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, stated that it had been considered; however, due to the grade (cross-slope), it was not as logical. Location of these areas was a site planning issue.

Acting Chair Winges opened the public hearing.

Bill McQuaid, 90 W. Avondale Road, expressed his concerns with the lack of parameters or definitions within the Hillsborough Municipal Code for court, play courts or sports courts. He

referred to the Staff Memorandum condition which provided a review process (administrative review) the applicants would be subject to in the event they pursued use of the concrete play area as a sports court in the future. He referenced the cities of Rolling Hills, CA, and Moraga, which provided definitions of “court” and “play court”. He requested that the concrete play area be relocated outside of the setback area and noted that this was the creation of an unsanctioned sports court through the label of a patio area. He continued to express concerns with the chain link fence and potential noise impacts associated with the concrete play area.

Acting Chair Winges closed the public hearing.

Boardmember Tenenbaum inquired with Mr. McQuaid if he had discussed his concerns with the owners.

Bill McQuaid, 90 W. Avondale Road, confirmed that he had discussed his concerns with the neighbors and continued to express his concerns with noise impacts associated with bouncing balls and other play activities.

Boardmember Tenenbaum expressed her support for the proposal, noting that the design was refreshing for the area and new home was designed appropriately for the neighborhood.

Boardmember Foster stated that the home was a good addition to the community and he expressed his appreciation for the efforts of the owners to incorporate changes into the plans. He noted that when items are not defined, it allows for the ADRB to utilize their discretion and make determinations. He inquired with Mr. McQuaid if his swimming pool was located in the setback area.

Bill McQuaid, confirmed that his pool was located in the setback area and explained the differences in use (length of time, seasons of use, etc) of a pool versus a sports court.

Boardmember Foster stated that the applicants had gone out of their way to make changes and it would not be a fair determination to allow one property owner to have a pool in the setback and deny another property owner the opportunity to have a patio in the setback. He noted his preference to not regulate the use of a property and that the Town retained noise ordinances with limitations if noise became an issue. He expressed his support for the proposal and noted it was a responsive application.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan commented on the uniqueness of the new residence, which was one of high quality. She added that the landscape improvements added softening and screening and expressed her appreciation for the project revisions, specifically at the rear patio area. She expressed her support for the proposal.

Acting Chair Winges complimented the design, although he noted the front facing garage, which is not preferred; however, the landscape plan included good amounts of screening. He added that the eight foot fence along the rear property line would help along with the topography of the site to provide a buffer between properties (to the rear). He added that the adjacent neighbor’s pool remained closer to the shared property line than the patio, along the rear property line. He noted that the way children would play in a yard could not be regulated or controlled and expressed his support for the current location of the patio on the plan. He then read the three options for incorporating a condition of approval on the project related to the concrete play area which staff provided in the Staff Memorandum.

A motion (Foster/Tenenbaum) to approve design review of a new Transitional style residence of approximately 4,637 square feet of floor area (24.90% Floor Area Ratio), including a lower level and associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new driveway design (secondary driveway), new patios, retaining walls and perimeter fencing passed 3:0 with the determination that the concrete play area is considered to be hardscape or patio area, per HMC Section 17.24.010(B)(2).

After the motion was completed, Chair Nyhus returned to the room.

5. **371 Barbara Way - Reyes (Nyhus Design Group / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for design review of a new single story English Country style residence of approximately 4,522 square feet of floor area (20.50% Floor Area Ratio) and an associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new patios, driveway surfacing and walkways. The proposal includes demolition of the existing single story ranch style residence. (*Preliminary review received on August 05, 2013*)

Chair Nyhus recused himself from review of the proposal as the project architect and Boardmember Winges recused himself due to a personal relationship with an adjacent neighbor and Boardmember Tenenbaum was appointed as Acting Chair.

Jeanne Davis, representing Nyhus Design Group, made a brief presentation to the ADRB and explained that due to the amount of public concern received and after reviewing the story poles installed, the owners proposed to reduce the overall height of the proposal by approximately five feet. She requested the opportunity to have these changes reviewed administratively by Planning Staff.

Michael Callan, landscape architect, addressed the public comment received regarding the concerns with tree types and that the applicants were open to changing the species. He requested the opportunity to work with Staff on the TCLA comments and tree species change.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum opened the public hearing.

Carol Terwilliger, 372 Darrell Road, the rear neighbor, expressed her concerns with the skylights on the rear roofline and the height of the proposal. She appreciated the proposed changes but noted that the landscaping could still be enhanced for a more dense screening, due to the drop in elevation between properties.

Dennis Tom, 379 Barbara Way, expressed his appreciation for the design changes and noted that he was very pleased with the changes. He thanked the project design team for their early outreach and noted that lowering of the roof would be more in character with the existing neighborhood context. He stated he would be happy to work directly with Michael Callan on the landscape issues at the right side property line (shared lot line).

Acting Chair Tenenbaum closed the public hearing.

Boardmember Foster thanked the neighbors and applicants for working closely together and noted that the architecture brings diversity to the neighborhood. He added that the proposed changes were great in addressing the neighbor concerns.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan concurred with Boardmember Foster regarding the proactive approach in presenting revisions to the design which address neighbor comment. She

complimented the materials of the proposal and suggested the applicants consider auto shades on the skylights to reduce light emission during the evening. She added that the design of the home was aesthetically pleasing and the style was more diverse than a typical ranch, which enhanced the neighborhood context.

Acting Chair Tenenbaum stated she was initially concerned with the height but the reduction was good. She added that the design had a bit of age to it and was stately. She noted the limited back up space behind the garage and encouraged any increase. Additionally, she thanked the applicants for their great outreach and response to the neighbors.

A motion (Ryan/Foster) to approve design review of a new single story English Country style residence of approximately 4,522 square feet of floor area (20.50% Floor Area Ratio) and an associated landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new patios, driveway surfacing and walkways, passed 3:0, subject to the following conditions:

1. The project shall be subject to the Town's Consulting Landscape Architect (TCLA) Comments via the administrative review procedures.
2. The overall height of the residence shall be lowered by approximately 5 feet as presented in the revised drawings at the September 03, 2013 ADRB Meeting, subject to the administrative review procedures.
3. The landscape plan shall be enhanced to address screening concerns associated with the public comment received, subject to the administrative review procedures.

After the motion was passed, Chair Nyhus and Boardmember Wings returned to the room.

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

(Not public hearing items; Board comments only.)

New Houses

6. **23 Annescourt Place - Salma (TRG Architects)**

Request for preliminary design review of a new two story Soft Modern style residence of approximately 5,625 square feet of floor area (25% Floor Area Ratio). The proposal includes demolition of an existing single story ranch style residence.

Boardmember Nyhus recused himself from review of the project due to a personal relationship with the applicant and left the room. Boardmember Wings was appointed as acting chair.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan complimented the new design of the residence. She noted that due to the high floor area ratio proposed, the high quality palette of materials and finishes was appreciated. She complimented the use of the nano doors and elevator as well as the application of stone. She noted the style was appropriate due to the existing mix of styles in the neighborhood and stressed the importance of retaining the highest quality materials in the design.

Boardmember Foster agreed and noted that the new home would be a good addition to the neighborhood mix of styles. He added that the design took advantage of the lot topography and complimented the efforts to retain the existing trees on the property.

Boardmember Tenenbaum complimented the preliminary review packet submitted and noted the high quality materials presented. She expressed support for the design.

Acting Chair Winges complimented the submittal packet and accurate rendering provided. He added that the garage location made sense and that the story poles would be an essential part of the review to determine privacy or visual impact issues with adjacent neighbors. He encouraged the applicants to conduct early public outreach as the large balconies could present issues. He complimented the colors, materials and composition of the design and noted that the Soft Modern approach was appropriate to the site with natural earth tones. He added that the brick walls were out of character with the house improvements.

After the comments were completed, Chair Nyhus returned to the room.

7. **125 Fallenleaf Drive - Belin (Essalat Architects)**

Request for preliminary design review of a new two story Contemporary style residence of approximately 7,717 square feet of floor area (21% Floor Area Ratio). The proposal includes the demolition of an existing single story residence.

Boardmember Tenenbaum stated that the home was easy to fall in love with; however, it could be a bit much in terms of change for the neighborhood. She remained interested to hear neighbor comments and noted that it appeared as a piece of art.

Boardmember Foster stated that the proposal emulated a work of art, was proposed in a neighborhood comprised of larger homes and would contribute to the diversity of design in the area.

Boardmember Winges noted the large setbacks proposed and the strong departure from the existing neighborhood context. He added that the proposed landscape appeared to be an Arizona type and complimented the use of high quality materials in the design. He recommended firming up the selection of materials and noted the massing as appropriate. He expressed concerns with the copper leaf element, specifically the roof layout and the color proposed for this element which may reduce the light feel of the leaf and may have a more commercial appearance. He noted that the project was an extremely interesting project and he was generally supportive with the exception of the copper leaf element.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan noted the high quality materials included in the design and noted the proposal was incredibly interesting and exciting. She noted that the roof appeared to be a fallen leaf on a contemporary building and a play on the street name.

Chair Nyhus noted the open spaces provided in the center of the residence and his hopes for a more organic presentation. He noted that the vertical scoring added interest and the form of a fallen leaf at the roof made the project very interesting.

8. **1952 Forest View Avenue - Chung (Suarez-Kuehne Architecture / Michael Callan Landscape)**

Request for preliminary design review of a new two story Colonial Revival style residence and detached second unit totaling approximately 13,321 square feet of floor area (21.7% Floor Area Ratio) and conceptual landscape plan including tree removal, new plantings, new swimming pool, new stone patios, new paver driveway and removal of an existing secondary driveway at the left side of the property. The proposal includes demolition of an existing two story colonial style residence.

Boardmember Winges stated the project retained excellent presentation and siting. He

complimented the replacement of an existing classical building with a new building of the same style, which was appropriate for the site and area. He noted that the landscape improvements, specifically the removal of the secondary driveway and lack of fountains, was opposite of what was typically seen and it worked with the site well. He noted the side entrance to the garage and complimented the excellent selection of materials. He noted he remained impressed with the understated elegance of the design and it was aggressive without being overbearing. He touched on the proposed metal roof and questioned if perhaps a shingle or flat slate roof would be more appropriate with metal accents. He acknowledged the room to maneuver around the existing redwood tree at the garage area, requested an update on the easement situation and encouraged the applicants to explore using shutters on other elevations of the residence.

Boardmember Tenenbaum stated the home appeared to belong on the site. She noted the amazing setting and appropriate siting of the new residence. She complimented the metal roof and recommended that the details of the drawings for the chimneys be refined as they appeared to be wood siding, not brick.

Boardmember Foster complimented the submittal package and agreed with the other Boardmembers that replacement of the existing structure with a new of the same type was appropriate. He added that due to the site configuration, the home remained isolated and retained the charm of the existing structure with an authentic appearance.

Alternate Boardmember Ryan stated that the home was previously a show house in 1987-1990 and at that time was amazing; however, it had changed over time. She commented on the increase in size of the home relative to the existing home and surrounding residences, specifically noting that the largest home in the vicinity was noted as 7,540 square feet, which the proposal would exceed by a great amount. She noted the difference in size of the homes as interesting. She expressed her preference for a different roof material than the proposed metal roof as well as incorporation of copper gutters and downspouts due to the size of the home. She stated the site was amazing and only questioned the size proposed.

Chair Nyhus stated he was pleased to see that the same street presence would be maintained. He expressed concern with the massing of the right side addition, specifically that the size made it difficult to retain proportion. He recommended exploration of incorporating a breezeway at the right wing to connect the right wing to the main residence. He noted that the right wing was out of scale and proportion. He acknowledged that the shed roof rake on the right side was the only occurrence of this element and commented on the transition at the shed dormers. He noted that the flat roof at the rear patio will be thicker in reality than presented and inquired on the possibility of carriage style doors at the garage area. He added that it was great to see the property redeveloped and the proportions at the right side were the biggest concern. He expressed his preference for the standing seam metal roof, noting it would be beautiful and there is precedent with the style to accommodate that style of roof.

DISCUSSION ITEM(S) – None.

ADJOURNMENT – 5:30 PM

Minutes Prepared By:



Serena Nevarez
Associate Planner